Can training in advanced clinical skills in obstetrics, neonatal care and leadership, of non-physician clinicians in Malawi impact on clinical services improvements (the ETATMBA project): a process evaluation

David R Ellard,1 Wanangwa Chimwaza,2 David Davies,3 Joseph Paul O’Hare,4 Francis Kamwendo,5 Siobhan Quenby,6 Frances Griffiths,7 On behalf of The ETATMBA Study Group

ABSTRACT

Objectives: The ‘enhancing human resources and the use of appropriate technologies for maternal and perinatal survival in sub-Saharan Africa’ (ETATMBA) project is training emergency obstetric and new-born care (EmONC) non-physician clinicians (NPCs) as advanced clinical leaders. Our objectives were to evaluate the implementation and changes to practice.

Design: A mixed methods process evaluation with the predominate methodology being qualitative.

Setting: Rural and urban hospitals in 8 of the 14 districts of northern and central Malawi.

Participants: 54 EmONC NPCs with 3 years’ plus experience.

Intervention: Training designed and delivered by clinicians from the UK and Malawi; it is a 2-year plus package of training (classroom, mentorship and assignments).

Results: We conducted 79 trainee interviews over three time points during the training, as well as a convenience sample of 10 colleagues, 7 district officers and 2 UK obstetricians. Trainees worked in a context of substantial variation in the rates of maternal and neonatal deaths between districts. Training reached trainees working across the target regions. For 46 trainees (8 dropped out of the course), dose delivered in terms of attendance was high and all 46 spent time working alongside an obstetrician. In early interviews trainees recalled course content unprompted indicating training had been received. Colleagues and district officers reported cascading of knowledge and initial changes in practice indicating early implementation. By the end of the training 74% of trainees had implemented new knowledge and skills. These included life-saving interventions for postpartum haemorrhage and eclampsia. Trainees identified the leadership training as enabling them to confidently change their own practice and initiate change in their health facility.

Conclusions: This process evaluation suggests that trainees have made positive changes in their practice. Clear impacts on maternal and perinatal mortality are yet to be elucidated.

INTRODUCTION

Enhancing human resources and the use of appropriate technologies for maternal and...
perinatal survival in sub-Saharan Africa (ETATMBA) is a European commission (FP7) funded project. In northern and central Malawi it is providing advanced clinical and leadership training (between November 2011 and June 2014) to non-physician clinicians (NPCs) who provide emergency obstetric and new-born care (EmONC).

A widespread crisis in the health workforce is affecting the realisation of health-related millennium development goals. There is also an imbalance in the range of health worker skills with many countries having too few specialist doctors such as surgeons, obstetricians and anaesthetists, relative to the health needs of their population.

An important indicator of the global personnel shortage in the health sector is the proportion of women assisted by skilled birth attendants. In most industrialised countries, skilled birth attendance is provided at almost all births while fewer than 50% of births in the majority of countries in South Asia and sub-Saharan Africa receive such support. Estimates show that skilled birth attendance rates are only improving at less than 0.5% per year: by 2015 it is likely that it will still be fewer than 50% of births where there is the support of a skilled birth attendant.

To address the global health workforce crisis many countries are now considering task-shifting strategies. Task shifting from physicians to non-physicians appears to be both safe and effective in countries that have organised and supported the extension of their maternal care in this way. In Malawi, NPCs have been established health providers since 1976 performing surgical procedures, giving anaesthetics and providing medical care. There are no clear career pathways for NPCs who are often undervalued. Enhancing the skills of this cadre is a vital approach to improving healthcare for mothers and babies in sub-Saharan Africa where there are few medical doctors. The WHO has made recommendations to optimise the NPCs role in maternal and new-born health.

The evaluation of ETATMBA involves a cluster randomised controlled trial with process evaluation. We report the process evaluation of the training. We report how the programme of training has been received and look for evidence that individual practice may have changed as a result.

The setting and intervention
Fifty NPCs working in EmONC were drawn from eight districts in central and northern Malawi to undertake the training (see online supplementary appendix).

Briefly, the training package was a 30-month programme of knowledge and skills training including mentoring of practice. In addition, two obstetricians at specialist registrar level with 5 years of clinical experience worked alongside the NPC, each for 2 weeks in each district, providing peer support and sharing skills and knowledge. Figure 1 contains a summary of the content of the training modules and further details are on the ETATMBA website (see online supplementary appendix).

METHODS
We used a mixed methods approach for this process evaluation with the predominate data being qualitative (see table 1).

Semistructured interviews were carried out at three time points. The first set of interviews was undertaken 4–5 months after the delivery of module 1 with a convenience sample of trainees. A researcher (WC) visited each intervention district for 1–2 days and interviewed ETATMBA trainees available during the visit. During the interviews, we asked the trainees about their perceptions of the training and support. With no prompting about training content we then asked them what new knowledge they gained. A researcher (WC) undertook the second set of interviews during 1–2-day visits to each intervention district 4–5 months after delivery of the second module on clinical leadership. We interviewed available trainees, asking them about training content and its implementation in their clinical work. We did this without prompting them. We then prompted them to talk about challenges and successes in using and sharing these skills in their facilities. We interviewed, during data collection visits, available district medical and nursing officers, exploring how they perceived the training and how it had fitted into their hospital. The researcher also asked the trainees to identify colleagues (cascadees) such as nurses, nurse midwives or NPCs to whom they had delivered some training. The researcher then sought interviews with available cascadees about the delivery and content of training they had received. Three researchers (WC, DRE and FG) carried out a third set of interviews with trainees, in an amendment to the protocol, while they were attending the week-long residential delivery of modules 5 and 6. We asked the trainees to provide specific examples of how they had used the training in their clinical work, describing actual cases. In the first part of the interview, we used no prompts about course content. In the latter part of the interview, trainees were asked to provide the examples from their clinical work of the application of each of the following key aspects of the training: delivery skills breech, vacuum extraction, caesarean section, neonatal resuscitation, management of postpartum haemorrhage (PPH), the use of partograms. At this time, we also interviewed the two obstetricians who had worked alongside the NPCs.

Data were drawn from Malawi Ministry of Health (MOH) documents for describing the context of the trial. Data from the MOH data on the pool of NPCs from which recruits were selected in the intervention districts are used to describe the reach of the intervention. Dose delivered is assessed using attendance and assignment submission logs.
All interviews were audio recorded and transcribed verbatim. A study specific Nvivo (V.10) project stored the transcripts and facilitated analysis. WC and DRE coded data with FG providing independent quality checks on 20% of transcripts early in the coding process. We adopted a thematic approach for analysis. We based coding on the interview schedule and initial reading of the transcripts. We added additional codes as themes emerged from the data. The coding team discussed and agreed on themes and their definitions. We discussed coding discrepancies, and coding definitions were refined. For analysis we used a modification of the process evaluation framework proposed by Steckler and Linnan. We present our study process evaluation framework in Table 1.

We extracted data relating to context from the MOH documents and present selected summary statistics to provide an illustration of the district. The officers from the MOH, who carried out the recruitment of the trainees, provided the overall numbers of NPCs from which they selected; a summary is provided.

**RESULTS**

We present the results mapped against our process evaluation categories. Where we provide brief illustrative
quotations from interviews, we identify the role and ID number of the interviewee, and where interviewees were interviewed more than once, we indicate whether it was interview 1, 2 or 3 (see online supplementary appendix for longer versions of quotations).

**Context**

The NPCs receiving the intervention worked in hospitals in the following eight districts of Malawi: Lilongwe south, Nkhotakota, Ntcheu, Chitipa, Karonga, Mzimba/Msusu, Kasungu and Rumphi. For the randomised controlled trial, the control districts were Lilongwe north, Dedza, Dowa, Mchinji, Ntchisi, Salima and Nkhata Bay. All districts have a district hospital; two also have a large central hospital (Lilongwe and Mzimba) and most have rural hospitals. Table 2, adapted from a 2011 Malawi MOH report, provides a summary of the population, maternal deaths, stillbirths and neonatal deaths for each of the study districts. The districts are a mix of urban and rural with populations ranging from 172,000 to 1,905,000 (median 397,000). There is variance across the districts in terms of the number of deliveries each year, with institutional deliveries ranging from 5298 to 53,426 (median 12,965). Maternal deaths range from 3 to 48 (median 14), stillbirths range from 116 to 988 (median 233) and early neonatal deaths (within 24 h of birth) range from 4 to 293 (median 100) with the perinatal mortality rate (per 1000 deliveries) ranging from 9.77 to 59.06 (median 24.7; see table 2).

**Reach**

Fifty-four trainees were recruited representing 67% (54/81) of the NPCs working in EmONC in the intervention districts. Of those recruited, 46 (85%) remained in the training programme at the time of the third interview, 25 from the central region of Malawi drawn from nine hospitals (district and central hospitals) and 21 from the northern region drawn from six hospitals (district and central hospitals). One of the smaller districts in the northern region had one ETATMBA trainee working in its district hospital. Nearly all the trainees are men with only two women. Our sample frame of EmONC NPCs included 81 NCPs of whom four were women.

**Dose delivered**

Six modules (five taught and one professional project) had been delivered by the time we completed data collection. The intervention comprised six modules (five taught and one professional project) delivered by six groups of trainers over a 7-month period. The intervention was delivered in six modules, with each module focusing on a specific topic. The modules were taught by a mix of local and international trainers, and participants were encouraged to apply their learning in their own clinical working context. At least 60% of participants attended each module. The intervention was delivered in a variety of settings, including hospitals, health centres, and community health centres. The intervention was delivered by a mix of local and international trainers, and participants were encouraged to apply their learning in their own clinical working context. At least 60% of participants attended each module. The intervention was delivered in a variety of settings, including hospitals, health centres, and community health centres.
collection for this process evaluation (see figure 1). The two obstetricians from the UK spent 6 months each in Malawi: the first from January 2012 to June 2012 and the second from July 2012 to January 2013. They rotated to all intervention hospitals, where they worked with each trainee reinforcing the training received during modules. They supported the use of operative skills new to the trainees including undertaking transverse as an alternative to midline incision for caesarean sections and the use of B-Lynch sutures for PPH. They also supported the use of all practical skills learnt through the course including the use of partographs, vacuum extraction, neonatal resuscitation and antibiotic prophylaxis in caesarean section.

Interviews with the trainees indicate that the obstetrician visits were valued, with many noting that the encouragement and support they received has helped to improve them as NPCs.

### Dose received

All trainees attended module 1 (54/54). Five trainees withdrew before module 2, so 49/54 attended. An additional three withdrew between modules 2 and 3, so 46/54 attended module 3. There was no more attrition for the remaining modules with all remaining trainees attending, with 46/54 attending modules 5 and 6 and completing the professional project. Reasons for withdrawal included the inability to find time for course work and switching to other courses.

In all interviews with trainees we found them able to recall, unprompted, some components of the training modules. For understanding dose received, we report specifically on data from the first set of interviews with 19 trainees. In later interviews the data on what they learnt did not add further to the analysis of the early implementation of the new knowledge and skills the trainees had received. Here we focus on how the trainees work with and transmit new learning to others (2/19); caesarean section (1/19); infection delivery (2/19); cascading of their new knowledge to others (2/19); caesarean section (1/19); infection control (1/19); management of eclampsia (1/19).

### Early implementation

The second set of interviews gives us insight into the early implementation of the new knowledge and skills the trainees had received. Here we focus on how the trainees work with and transmit new learning to others in their work place (see box 1). Of the 12 trainees interviewed, 10 talked about how the leadership training had helped them work better with those around them. District Health Officers reported that the trainees were

---

**Table 2** An overview of the ETATMBA intervention districts showing population, maternal deaths, stillbirths and neonatal deaths 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District population (1000)</th>
<th>Number of institutional* deliveries</th>
<th>Maternal deaths (all facilities) direct†</th>
<th>Maternal death rate (per 1000 deliveries)</th>
<th>Stillbirth (per 1000 deliveries)</th>
<th>Early neonatal deaths‡</th>
<th>Perinatal mortality rate (per 1000 deliveries)§</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Northern region districts</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chitipa</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>7177</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karonga</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>7422</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mzimba</td>
<td>862</td>
<td>27 697</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>430</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nkhata Bay</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>5298</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.64</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rumphi</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>8014</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Central region districts</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedza</td>
<td>624</td>
<td>17 751</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>327</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dowa</td>
<td>558</td>
<td>14 394</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kasungu</td>
<td>627</td>
<td>16 824</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>395</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mchinji</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>16 800</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nkhotokota</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>8444</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ntcheu</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>16 065</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ntchisi</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>6934</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salima</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>11 536</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lilongwe</td>
<td>1905</td>
<td>53 426</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>988</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table adapted from Republic of Malawi Ministry of Health report; Malawi 2010 EmONC needs assessment final report.21

*Institutional deliveries—deliveries which take place in a health facility (not home births).
†Direct complications and direct causes of maternal death include: antepartum haemorrhage (APH), postpartum haemorrhage, obstructed/prolonged labour, ectopic pregnancy, severe abortion complications, retained placenta, ruptured uterus, postpartum sepsis, severe pre-eclampsia/eclampsia. Excludes ‘other’ direct complications or causes of death including non-severe abortion complications weighted for total number of health centres.
‡Early neonatal death was defined as a death occurring within 24 h after delivery.
§Perinatal mortality rate=(stillbirths+v. early neonatal deaths)/(number of deliveries).
Box 1  Representative examples of the early implementation of new skills and knowledge

Obstetrician support and example of skills recalled
The number of C-sections was going up... teaching them vacuum extractions we would improve this... we used the Kiwi (vacuum extraction equipment). [Obstetrician 2]
The attachment that we had of the obstetrician... we actually were able to change from the routine way of doing things to real evidence based... [T23.3]
When we are resuscitating a new born we gave up very easily... I have learnt that time and improved knowledge on how to resuscitate a new born can make a difference to the life of the baby. [T33.1]

Representative examples of early implementation of skills and knowledge
This course has really helped me to change the way I am interacting with my colleagues... We can start with the positives and end with the negatives, so that has really changed me, this is now how I work, both with my colleagues and the DHO. [T46: 2]

DHOs
I have seen a couple of them doing neonatal and maternal deaths audits and sharing those experiences with other health care workers. Also advocating for change in practice, change in attitude. They have taken a leading role to ensure that prenatal care scales up in this district. [DO 2]

Cascade
...I also learnt as a new thing, clearly defined steps of how to do resuscitation of the baby. [CA 10]
I see myself improving in these areas... like vacuum extraction, the timing itself... the benefits of doing caesarean section when it is supposed to be done. [CA 5]
That equipment, the Kiwi (vacuum extraction equipment), we were just leaving things because we didn’t know how to use it. These guys (the trainees) they helped us to use these things. [CA 12]

New techniques like the condom tamponade, it was quite new to me, at school we did not learn anything about condom tamponade. [CA 3]
We didn’t know that when somebody is suffering pre-eclampsia they give her magnesium sulphate... but after the training now we have it in the labor ward... if it is needed we give magnesium sulphate, then we refer the patient. [CA 14]

Take the example of eclamptic case, everybody was afraid to use magnesium sulphate but now everybody is capable of using magnesium sulphate. [CA 6]
In things like PPH (postpartum haemorrhage), I was trying to tell them memory is not good enough. When you want to remember something you put it on the wall so you don’t have to memorise... I actually had to get them to write their posters and put it on the wall, so that you just look at it and you just remember. [Obstetrician 1]

I remember they used get a nurse or an external speaker to come and teach them on a particular topic at the CPD (continuing professional development) session. After their training they decided they could use this particular session to cascade the training. [Obstetrician 2]
He goes out orienting people on the use of vacuum extraction... he goes around in the health centres so the clinicians get skills from him. [DO 6]

*The quotations here have been edited; fuller versions can be seen in the online supplementary material.

Taking leading roles in improving healthcare practice and cascadees indicate that trainees were sharing their knowledge and skills with those around them. Most commonly reported, as having been taught, was neonatal resuscitation. Several cascadees reported improved understanding of the use of procedures they had been unfamiliar with and similarly one reported they received instruction on how to use equipment that until then had remained unused (vacuum extraction equipment).

Several reported learning new techniques of managing PPH, including the use of the drugs misoprostol and oxytocin and the condom tamponade. The use of magnesium sulfate to manage pre-eclampsia was a learning experience for several cascadees. Cascadees also talked about the trainees sharing knowledge about infection control, including effective hand washing.

In their interviews, the obstetricians mentioned encouraging or experiencing trainees cascading their learning and district officers described seeing evidence of trainees cascading what they had learnt to their colleagues.

Later implementation
We report from the interviews with 39 trainees in the third set of interviews. These provide evidence of how they used the various skills and knowledge from their training in clinical practice. We report data from the section of the interview where we prompted for data on each of the key aspects of the training. First, we report on the use of practical skills, then the use of audit skills.

Finally, we report on the use of leadership skills, particularly when used in conjunction with practical skills learnt on the course. The subsections under each of the three headings are in frequency order with those discussed the most at the top.

Practical skills
Twenty-eight of the 39 interviewees mentioned the training about caesarean section, 26 mentioned using the transverse incision as a new skill.

Twenty-seven trainees mentioned neonatal resuscitation as a skill they encountered in the training with 25 giving examples of how they had used the skills in practice. Seventeen indicated that they had cascaded the skill to their colleagues in their facilities. This was not a skill new to them but they described how the training’s more systematic approach was previously lacking. Several trainees mentioned upgrading their knowledge about resuscitation and on the length of time to continue resuscitating a baby.

Twenty-three trainees talked about skills in the management of a PPH. Out of these, 19 trainees reported using the skills in practice. Six trainees had used aorta compression; five had used the B-Lynch suture; five had used the condom tamponade; and three had used misoprostol. Two people mentioned coordinating efforts for the management of PPH.
Fourteen trainees mentioned the training had helped them realise the advantages of monitoring labour with the use of partograms.

Thirteen people mentioned vacuum extraction as a skill they encountered in the ETATMBA training. Most of the trainees mentioned that though it was not a new skill, they had lacked expertise to perform it. The training improved their skill and confidence. Three reported cascading the skill to their colleagues. Several trainees said their clinical judgement had improved as to whether to conduct vacuum extraction or not. For example, where a caesarean section would have been normal practice, vacuum extraction is now considered.

Twelve trainees discussed learning about vaginal breech delivery skills but only two were able to cite examples of how they had used the skills. Several trainees indicated they had managed to cascade the skill to others. Trainees indicated that learning the skills for breech delivery helped reduce the number of caesarean sections (see box 2).

Audit
Of the 39 trainees participating in the third set of interviews, all had undertaken two audits and 35 mentioned audit as an important skill. Table 3 presents examples of audits and their outcome.

**Box 2** Representative examples of the implementation of skills and knowledge*

…one of our tutors came. They facilitated changing to the transverse type incision at our institution. It has been adopted...

[T12:3]

We used to have a lot of neonatal deaths because of poor skill of resuscitation before ETATMBA, because easily giving up…We’ve actually seen that the babies that we then used to say no, you can dispose, wait for it to die, have survived, actually very healthy babies. [T30:3]

I applied the B-lynch suture, with my colleague another ETATMBA trainee…we applied it and the patient actually, stopped bleeding. The patient actually went home, was discharged from the facility… it gave me courage, and I did it and it actually saved a life. [T45:3]

At this point in time, we are really following the partogram and we are really taking action on each and every deviation from the normal. Not only ETATMBA students but even the nurses. So we are working together now. [T32:3]

…what we call a Kiwi vacuum extraction…So, patients who could have gone for caesarean section with prolonged labour, we are able to assist them with vacuum extraction. [T1:3]

We managed to cascade the training on breech deliveries…Now after the training, at least most of the nurses at the hospital are able to do this. [T35:3]

Breech delivery, to me it was one of the most difficult scenarios encountered…But after going through this course we have learnt how to…So, now we are able to deliver, the breech deliveries. [T28:2]

*These quotations have been edited; fuller versions can be seen in the online supplementary material.

Leadership
Trainees talk with pride, excitement and enthusiasm about leadership training; about how it had helped them bring about changes in clinical care. For many it was a revelation that by taking a different approach they achieved so much. Trainees have developed a collaborative approach to working with colleagues, particularly the nurses, which was not there before; they felt empowered to approach management about issues including being strategic in seeking, finding or using resources. The visiting obstetricians comment positively of the impact of the leadership training (box 3).

**DISCUSSION**

The results of this process evaluation indicated that the educational intervention for NPCs was received by the NPCs attending the training and that the NPCs used the training to change their own clinical practice and to influence the clinical practice of others working in their health facility. All the NPCs interviewed were able to provide examples of actual cases where the use of their newly acquired clinical skills had made a difference to the outcome for mother or baby. They were particularly enthusiastic about the leadership training. They drew on this training when making changes to clinical practice in their health facility, when seeking to change the dynamic of teamwork towards a more collaborative approach and when redirecting the use of resources. Trial results will reveal if the changes reported resulted in a change in perinatal and maternal mortality in the districts.

This study has demonstrated a willingness to change clinical practice in obstetrics resulting from the educational intervention for NCPs. For such change a team of people have to assent to the change, including NCPs in obstetrics, NCPs in anaesthetics, midwives, district medical officers, pharmacy and laboratory staff. For example, changing from caesarean section for breech presentation to vaginal breech delivery requires a culture change for all hospital labour ward personnel, but it has the potential to save maternal deaths from complications of caesarean section and to save scarce healthcare resources that can be used to save the life of another patient. Some NPCs did not report implementing skills learnt that other NCPs had implemented within the timeframe of our evaluation. The educational intervention was a combination of 1-week lecture courses, emergency simulations, one-to-one clinical on-the-job training and leadership training. This was considerably more substantial than other existing, emergency obstetric, 3-day courses. We suggest that this multifaceted educational approach to change clinical practice is a powerful and novel way of reducing the burden of maternal and neonatal mortality in sub-Saharan Africa.

A number of published studies have examined the engagement of NPCs in surgical work. Three papers...
report evaluation of additional training given to NPCs. All report that training NPCs in specific skills (not obstetrics or neonatal care) is feasible and that NPCs can safely perform surgical procedures with the right training and support.\textsuperscript{14} \textsuperscript{24} \textsuperscript{25} None of these papers evaluates how the training is implemented into clinical practice.

A study in 2010 reports interviews with NPCs undertaking gynaecological procedures in Malawi. The study found NPCs felt at ease performing operations but the ing gynaecological procedures in Malawi. The study highlighted the need for training and support.\textsuperscript{13} A recently reported trial of an intervention in Malawi covering the years prior to our study demonstrated an improvement in maternal and neonatal mortality rates.\textsuperscript{26} \textsuperscript{27} This intervention included quality improvement intervention at health facilities along with a participatory women’s group community intervention.

A limitation of our intervention is that it is limited to training NCPs who may not remain working in the same health facility.

Process evaluations are increasingly important in the evaluation of health interventions to place the effectiveness/non-effectiveness of the intervention in context.\textsuperscript{19} The conduct of process evaluations is being established in Africa in maternal and child health research and evaluations of HIV/AIDs programmes.\textsuperscript{27} \textsuperscript{31} Our process evaluation suggests there has been real change in the professionalism of this group. However, changes in clinical practice may not yet be sufficiently consistent to impact on perinatal and maternal mortality. The huge variations in mortality rates across districts at baseline may prove to be a confounding factor in translating our very positive

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Audit topic\textsuperscript{*}</th>
<th>Example of audit outcome reported at interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Use of partographs</td>
<td>Trainee found that nurses/midwives were not completing the partograph routinely. After presenting audit findings at team meeting and providing training there was change in practice: So, what we see today is, any patient going to labour ward the nurse fill out the labour graph, and record and monitor. They now see that the monitoring aspect has a bearing on the outcome [9:3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of pre-eclampsia and eclampsia</td>
<td>I went to the DNO with my findings…most of the health centres don’t have magnesium sulphate…they are afraid to give magnesium sulphate and they cannot order the drug…For this year I have not seen any death from eclampsia…we are able to manage them there because they are stabilised (at the health centre) before they arrive (at the hospital) [T40:3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postabortion care</td>
<td>Trainee noted that current system was chaotic and that there was a lack of instruments (During the audit) in the pharmacy I found equipment, (lying unused)...I distributed it around the health centres…I conducted some training like to teach them how to do a vacuum extraction, how to take care of a vacuum extractor…for the instruments to stay longer. So, it has really given me a clue, of trying to check some things, doing this now and again as a way of improving services [T2:3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neonatal sepsis</td>
<td>An audit of neonatal services found high sepsis rates in neonates. Reporting findings back to the group had a positive impact on practice. The sepsis (rate) has reduced by this time after the auditing [T12:3]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neonatal resuscitation</td>
<td>Audit found clinical staff were not following the step-by-step procedure for neonatal resuscitation and not documenting the procedure. After sharing the results of the audit and training of colleagues there was improvement in the following of the step-by-step procedure previously probably we were not putting things in order and then with the ETATMBA students they have drilled us to follow each step...we are resuscitating step by step...[NMW cascadee]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postpartum haemorrhage</td>
<td>An audit revealed colleagues were not checking vital signs when patients were and the hospital did not have misoprostol for controlling the bleeding. After presenting to the management and colleagues the management agreed to stock misoprostol and he saw a change in practice in terms of checking for vital signs. Another audit resulted in change in practice as follows: Every patient from now, whether from the health centre or not, if they can’t get access for two IV (intravenous) lines they are able now to put even one at least, which is ok. Instead of leaving the patient alone with the driver (of car bringing the patient to hospital), at least they are able from the health centres to send somebody to accompany the patient in case of any problems [T9:3]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{*}Audit topics in descending order of frequency reported.

ETATMBA, enhancing human resources and the use of appropriate technologies for maternal and perinatal survival in sub-Saharan Africa; MVA, manual vacuum aspirations.
of training for these clinicians with an emphasis on health for low resource countries in much of sub-Saharan Africa. Here we have evaluated a model of cascade training was limited as we only interviewed cascadees as the interview accounts suggest.

A limiting factor in this study may have been that trainees are likely to report what they consider to be socially acceptable to the evaluation team. However, they were reporting actual examples where lives had been saved, such as preventing the death of a woman from PPH, and provided detail that suggested these events had actually happened. However, the trainees are likely to remember and report these dramatic events, but these events may be rare. Our assessment of the cascading of training was limited as we only interviewed cascadees who had received training. These limitations caution us that the results of the clinical trial may not be as positive as the interview accounts suggest.

During the delivery of the intervention, over time, there was concurrent delivery within the districts involved in this trial (intervention and control districts) of other training initiatives from non-government organisations for all relevant health professionals on neonatal resuscitation. This is likely to improve perinatal outcome in intervention and control districts and is a confounding variable to the trial results.

Task shifting in countries like Malawi is at present necessary for the provision of healthcare. NPCs provide and are likely to continue to provide the majority of healthcare for low resource countries in much of sub-Saharan Africa. Here we have evaluated a model of training for these clinicians with an emphasis on problem solving through leadership, audit and service improvement. During the process of developing and establishing the training it became clear that raising the status and quality of the educational experience through accreditation was a vital strategy. In Malawi, this approach has now been extended to train a further 60 NPCs in obstetrics and five other specialties, supported by the Malawi MOH, College of Medicine and faith-based organisations. While much remains to be done, shared leadership training that empowers NPCs to produce clinical service improvement has potential to improve the health of mothers and babies in Africa.

**Author affiliations**

1. Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Division of Health Sciences, Warwick Medical School, The University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
2. College of Medicine, Malawi University, Blantyre, Malawi
3. Educational Development & Research Team, Warwick Medical School, The University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
4. Division of Metabolic & Vascular Health, Warwick Medical School, The University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
5. Obstetrics and Gynaecology Department, Malawi University, College of Medicine, Blantyre, Malawi
6. Division of Reproductive Health, Warwick Medical School, The University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
7. Division of Health Sciences, Warwick Medical School, The University of Warwick, Coventry, UK

**Collaborators** Authors acting on behalf of the ETATMBA study group below. The ETATMBA Study Group – FK, Chisale Mhango, WC, Chikayiko Chivandira and Queen Duke, University of Malawi College of Medicine, Malawi; Fannie Kachale and Chimwemwe Mvula, Ministry of Health, Malawi; Godfrey Mbaruiku, Paul Khaile, Sidney Ndeki, Hamed Mohamed, Senga Pembu, Aloisia Shemdoe and Festo Mazuguni, Ifakara Health Institute, Tanzania; Staffan Bergström, Karolinska Institutet, Sweden; Alan Davies, GE Healthcare, UK; JPO, SQ, Douglas Simkiss, DD, DRE, FG, Ngija-bakwin, Kandala, Anne-Marie Brennan, Edward Peille, Anne-Marie Slivther, Saliya Chipvete, Paul Bebee, Gregory Eloundou, Harry Gee and Vinod Patel, The University of Warwick, UK.

**Contributors** DRE, JPO, WC, FG, SQ and DD were responsible for the design, management and delivery of the training.

**Funding** This work was funded by the European Commission, Seventh Framework Programme. Project no. 266290.

**Competing interests** JPO (FRCP, MD) is the principal investigator for the trial and is Director of Quality Assurance at Warwick Medical School (UK). DRE (PhD) is a Senior Research Fellow in the Warwick Clinical Trials unit (UK) and has expertise in research design, implementation and evaluation. FG (PhD) is Professor of Medicine in Society, Division of Health Science, Warwick Medical Schools, The University of Warwick (UK). FK (MD, PhD) is a Consultant Obstetrician/Gynaecologist and is principal investigator for the trial at College of Medicine, Malawi. SQ (MD, MRCOG) is Professor of Obstetrics Honorary Consultant Obstetrician at University Hospitals Coventry and Warwickshire (UK) with research interests being translational research into recurrent miscarriage, implantation, preterm and dysfunctional labour, and obesity in pregnancy. DD (PhD) is an Associate Professor (Reader) in the Warwick Medical School Educational Development & Research Team. His research interests are primarily in global health education and educational technology and e-learning in medical education. WC is a researcher and PhD student at the College of Medicine, Malawi.

**Ethics approval** The study was approved by the Biomedical Research Ethics Committee (BREC) at the University of Warwick, UK (143/09/2011) and The College of Medicine research ethics committee (COMREC), Malawi (P.07/11/1102). It has the approval and support of the Ministry of Health, Malawi.
REFERENCES


Can training, in advanced clinical skills in obstetrics, neonatal care and leadership, of non-physician clinicians, in Malawi, impact on clinical services improvements (The ETATMBA Project): A process evaluation

Supplementary appendix

The setting
For the ETATMBA project in Malawi the districts in the central and northern region of the country were randomised to intervention or control groups. There are 14 districts in these regions. Lilongwe district has a population more than double that of any other district so for the project it was divided into two sections geographically taking into account health care facilities. One section was randomised to receive the intervention and the other to be in the control group. Fifty NPCs working in emergency obstetric and new-born care (EmONC) were drawn from the eight intervention districts to undertake the training. The process of recruiting the NPCs was undertaken by the Ministry of Health in Malawi. NPCs were required to have at least three years of experience in the role and to apply for a place on the training. Recruitment aimed for a minimum of two NPCs who worked in each hospital in the intervention districts.

The training programme
The programme involved five week-long intensive training sessions in advanced obstetrics, neonatal care, leadership, understanding research evidence and critical appraisal combined with in-service training of two six-month periods on enhanced teaching, training and audit, supported by tutors via the Internet. In addition, two obstetricians at specialist registrar level with 5 years of clinical experience worked alongside the NPC, each for two weeks in each district providing peer support and sharing of skills and knowledge. At the start of the programme there was assessment and examination of knowledge, competence and performance and further assessment of knowledge, competence and performance at the end. Each trainee is working towards a University of Warwick undergraduate degree requiring successful completion of a number of assessments: two audits, reflective practice, two professional projects and training others, e.g. other NPCs, nurse midwives and nurses. Further detail is on the ETATMBA website. ([http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/med/about/global/etatmba/about/](http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/med/about/global/etatmba/about/)) We undertook data collection for this process evaluation from the start of the training so we could use the early data collected to inform adjustments to the training delivery. For example, early interviews revealed problems with Internet access so additional provision was arranged. In order to complete data analysis before the trial results became available we ceased data collection before the end of the training programme with the trainees still to complete another taught module and a final professional project.

The team delivering the intervention were not involved in the interview data collection or data analysis. Authors DD, JPoH and FK are members of the intervention delivery team. They contributed to the design of the process evaluation, provided advice on content and timing of interviews and reviewed the final analysis to consider its implications.

Below we present the unedited versions of the quotations that are presented in the main paper.
A trainee recalling, unprompted, components of the training modules

> When we are resuscitating a new born we gave up very easily because people were saying a new born who cannot breath after ten minutes then that one will be useless. But we have found that given time and given good extra time, you find that it could be done. I have learnt that time and improved knowledge on how to resuscitate a new born can make a difference to the life of the baby. [T33:1]

Early implementation
Examples from second set of interviews exploring the seeds of training and knowledge imparted by ETATMBA being used in practice.
This course has really helped me to change the way I am interacting with my colleagues..., because the approach to colleagues is very important. Sometimes you can talk to colleagues while angry or even with a sense of contempt, but with this training we have learnt how we can talk with colleagues. It has changed me because I know how I can talk to my bosses at work. If we have an issues as clinicians and nurses which we need to present to the DHO (District Health Officer), now we are taught that we must have facts and we must approach him humbly. We can start with the positives and end with the negatives, so that has really changed me, this is now how I work, both with my colleagues and the DHO. [T46: 2]

District Health Officers reported that the trainees were taking leading roles in improving health care practice:

I have seen a couple of them doing neonatal and maternal deaths audits and sharing those experiences with other health care workers. Also advocating for change in practice, change in attitude. They have taken a leading role to ensure that prenatal care scales up in this district. [DO 2]

Cascadee interviews reveal areas where the trainees have passed on training and new knowledge to colleagues. We find that this is not just specific skills from the ETATMBA training it also includes ‘good practice’ like hand washing and aseptic techniques.

I also learnt as a new thing, clearly defined steps of how to do resuscitation of the baby. [CA 10]
I see myself improving in these areas..., like vacuum extraction, the timing itself. Previously we were just rushing in doing vacuum extraction in women where it was not supposed to be done, just to run away from procedures like caesarean section. After that training we have learnt something on how we can do it in proper time and the benefits of doing caesarean section when it is supposed to be done. [CA 5]

That equipment, the Kiwi (vacuum extraction equipment), we were just leaving things because we didn’t know how to use it. These guys (the trainees) they helped us to use these things, which had been just staying in the labour ward but we didn’t know how to use them. [CA 12]

New techniques like the condom tamponade, it was quite new to me, at school we did not learn anything about condom tamponade. [CA 3]

We didn’t know that when somebody is suffering pre-eclampsia they gave her magnesium sulphate. Since this is a health centre we didn’t have magnesium sulphate but after the training now we have it in the labor ward. When the patient just arrives, it should be, see the condition of a patient and if it is needed we give magnesium sulphate, then we refer the patient. That is how we are working. [CA 14]

Take the example of eclamptic case, everybody was afraid to use magnesium sulphate but now everybody is capable of using magnesium sulphate. [CA 6]

In things like PPH (postpartum haemorrhage), I was trying to tell them memory is not good enough. When you want to remember something you put it on the wall so you don’t have to memorise. It is easy for you to see and say ok, PPH we need......medicine. For them they found this difficult, so what I did was, in two hospitals I actually had to get them to write their posters and put it on the wall, so that you just look at it and you just remember. [Obstetrician 1]

I remember they used get a nurse or an external speaker to come and teach them on a particular topic at the CPD (continuing professional development) session. After their training they decided they could use this particular session to cascade the training. [Obstetrician 2]
He goes out orienting people on the use of vacuum extraction ... he goes around in the health centres so the clinicians get skills from him. [DO 6]

Later implementation
Here we report from the interviews with 39 trainees in the third set of interviews. These provide evidence of how they used the various skills and knowledge from their training in clinical practice. Here we report data from the section of the interview where we prompted for data on each of the key aspects of the training.

Practical skills
Caesarean Section (29/39 discuss this)
The training was different from what has been happening at our institution... we discussed as a group at our institution, then when one of our tutors came. They facilitated changing to the transverse type incision at our institution. It has been adopted that in every patient, it has to be done with that (transverse) incision. [T12:3]

Neonatal Resuscitation (27/39 discuss this)
We used to have a lot of neonatal deaths because of poor skill of resuscitation before ETATMBA, because easily giving up. The literature we read in school used to say resuscitate a baby for about 20 minutes. If it’s longer than that you can drop it because what might come out might not be a useful baby. But in this module we learnt that we can resuscitate our neonates as long as we have positive heartbeat. We’ve actually seen that the babies that we then used to say no, you can dispose, wait for it to die, have survived, actually very healthy babies. So, that’s just an example that I have actually enjoyed. [T30:3]

Postpartum Haemorrhage (23/39 discuss this)
I applied the B-lynch suture, with my colleague another ETATMBA trainee...we applied it and the patient actually, stopped bleeding. We managed to give fluids and transfuse, and she improved. The patient actually went home, was discharged from the facility. Before the training I never used it. I had heard of the B-lynch suture but was so afraid to use it. I was given a chance to actually use it on a stimulation in the practical part of the class. It was made so simple ... it gave me courage, and I did it and it actually saved a life. So that gave me courage. [T45:3]

You have to call for assistance and you need to take a sample for the laboratory for grouping and cross-match. We are encouraging people to use big hole cannulas, preferably where is possible you need to insert two on both arms to make sure that the circulation is not depleted. There is also encouragement of monitoring of vital signs, it is very crucial in people with PPH, even the use of antibiotics since most of time there are various procedures during the management of PPH, so you can also give prophylactic antibiotic to prevent this woman from sepsis after PPH [T24 3]

Partograms (14/39 discuss this)
At this point in time, we are really following the partogram and we are really taking action on each and every deviation from the normal. If cervical dilation is not there... action is being taken. Not only ETATMBA students but even the nurses. Whenever they see something is deviating from the normal, they consult...this patient came in with this problem and the partograph is moving to the other side, so please assist. So we are working together now. [T32:3]

Vacuum Extraction (13/39 discuss this)
We have been taught the skill of vacuum extraction. And at one time, I think last year we were given, what we call a Kiwi vacuum extraction...and that one we are able to use. So, patients who could have gone for caesarean section with prolonged labour, we are able to assist them with vacuum extraction. [T1:3]
Breech (12/39 discuss this)

We managed to cascade the training on breech deliveries. Before we were taught, when there was a breech, they used to call somebody ….whoever was more senior clinician in the institution to go and deliver the breech. Now after the training, at least most of the nurses at the hospital are able to do this. [T35:3]

Breech delivery, to me it was one of the most difficult scenarios encounter. When there was a breech delivery, most of the time I was just saying let’s just do C-section, running away from how I could deliver it. But after going through this course we have learnt how to tackle that particular breech because they are several types, each type has got its own way of delivery. So, now we are able to deliver, the breech deliveries. [T28:2]

Leadership

Leadership was, without doubt, the part of the training that trainees talked about most and with the most enthusiasm. Many trainees became quite excited during the interview when talking about how they had used these skills to bring about change in the clinical care delivered. For many it was a revelation that by taking a different approach so much could be achieved. Here we provide examples that provide additional insight into how the trainees were using their new learning. Trainees had developed a collaborative approach to working with their colleagues, particularly the nurses, which was not there before.

We share, I just don’t go there and say, do you know how to resuscitate? (I say ) come and let me teach you, we go together sister, let’s start, bring that, bring that, we say this one we put here, maybe the mask, this is how we position the baby, am starting to bank watch for this, then she goes oh ok, what about this? We work as a team. [T41:3]

They had learnt to be strategic in seeking, finding or using resources.

Nurses were going through the training for newborn resuscitation. So, it was easy for me to work with the nurses, who had already gone through this training. I was able to organise a good area for resuscitation and lobby for more resource from the DHO. [T15:3]

Some said no, they are not working because maybe they were worn out things, like that… I discussed this with the nurse in charge of the ward…and our colleagues in theatre. We looked around and we found things here and there and actually we have now replaced them. [T14:3]

We complain that we don’t have blood in the laboratory, but there are some procedures that are done where the patient has been asked to mobilise blood yet we don’t need to use this blood in the end. Some patients were being given blood that did not require blood. After this training, if a patient donates blood for a procedure, if we see that this patient do not require this blood, we keep it and channel it to a patient that may be in dire need of blood. [T23:3]

There was also evidence in the interviews with the obstetricians of the impact of the leadership training.

I wanted the relationship between them and other clinicians to improve so they would work as a team not as individuals…it was good to see change whilst we were there. The midwives would come to say “we never used to do these things with clinical officers before, but you know they don’t now wait to be called they come and check with us what is going on and we would tell them and we would discuss management”. [Obstetrician]

(I saw them) taking on some leadership roles because they were respected. They were actually doing their audits and some had results with them so they presented to the district health management team…(about) things that they wanted to change. [Obstetrician 2]