Prevalence of anxiety and depressive symptoms among emergency physicians in Libya after civil war: a cross-sectional study

Muhammed Elhadi,1 Ala Khaled,1 Ans Bassam Malek,2 Ahmed El-Alem El-Azhari,3 Ahmed Zakaria Gwea,3 Ahmed Zaid,1 Salman Mabruk Elturki,4 Ahmed Aburgegah,2 Munir Ahmed K Abu Ageila,5 Abdulmueti Alhadi,6 Hafed Abdulwahhab Albashkar,7 Aliyah Mustafa Alshareef,8 Adel Basher Ben Nama,9 Nizar Aljarboue Mohammed Sahboun,7 Hazem Ahmed1

ABSTRACT

Objectives We aimed to identify the prevalence of depression and anxiety among physicians working in the emergency departments of nine tertiary care centres in Libya.

Design This was a cross-sectional study.

Setting Nine main tertiary centres in Libya

Participants Emergency department doctors were surveyed between December 2018 and February 2019.

Intervention The standardised Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS) was selected as a measurement tool for analysing anxiety and depression symptoms; a HADS score of 8 indicated anxiety as well as depression symptoms. The primary outcomes were anxiety and depression, which were tabulated with independent sociodemographic variables. χ² tests were conducted to compare the prevalence of anxiety and depression between the groups. Statistical analysis was performed using SPSS V.25.

Results A total of 108 out of 150 (72%) emergency physicians from all levels participated in the study and took the survey. The emergency physicians had a mean±SD age of 31.2±4.5 years, and were predominantly males (74 out of 108, 68.5%). Overall, 49 (45.4%) physicians reached the cut-off score to define both depression and anxiety (ie, a score ≥8). In terms of violence, 71 (65.7%) reported incidents of verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias. In addition, 28 reported being threatened by verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias. Overall, 49 (45.4%) physicians reached the cut-off score to define both depression and anxiety (ie, a score ≥8). In terms of violence, 71 (65.7%) reported incidents of verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias. In addition, 28 reported being threatened by verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias. In addition, 28 reported being threatened by verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias.

Conclusion The high prevalence rate of anxiety and depression is of concern, and the high rate of physical and verbal abuse highlights the range of abuse endured by doctors in Libya. Therefore, screening for anxiety and depression at regular intervals is needed to avoid the deterioration of mental health, which can increase the risk of suicide and dropping out, and decrease the level of healthcare for patients.

INTRODUCTION

Depression and anxiety symptoms are highly prevalent among physicians, especially those working in hospital emergency departments where they operate under stressful conditions due to their job circumstances in terms of working hours, number of night shifts and social pressures. In addition, Libyan physicians are at higher risk of being kidnapped, killed, or threatened by militias or armed forces due to the local circumstances of the civil war.

Despite knowledge about stressors and health hazards, physicians may not be aware of the factors that can affect their mental health. However, identifying the symptoms of anxiety and depression is crucial, so that appropriate interventions can be applied. Burnout and depressive disorders have increased among physicians due to multiple environmental and personal factors, such as lack of social support, significant mental and physical demands, and lack of job satisfaction.

Several studies have identified a link between decreased quality of patient care...
associated with distress and increased medical error rates in clinical residents.\textsuperscript{5–7} However, the prevalence of anxiety and depression symptoms varies across studies, with some reporting more than half of all participating physicians as depressed.\textsuperscript{8} Studies also indicate different results depending on the years of training, medical specialty and demographic characteristics.\textsuperscript{9–11}

Although many studies have focussed on physician anxiety and depression symptoms and have identified a substantial association, questions regarding risk factors of physicians’ anxiety and depression remain, especially in conflict areas where physicians are at a higher risk of mental illness.\textsuperscript{12 13}

Not enough data are available regarding anxiety and depression rates among doctors or the general population in Libya, following multiple civil wars.\textsuperscript{14} In addition, significant issues have arisen around the attrition rate of doctors working in Libyan emergency departments due to conflicts and insecurity since 2011.\textsuperscript{15 16} Circumstances have led to an increased risk of verbal and physical violence against doctors who work in emergency departments to improve the life-threatening conditions imposed by militias that control the cities in Libya.\textsuperscript{17}

The estimation of depression and anxiety prevalence among emergency physicians is essential for helping health authorities to identify factors contributing to physician distress and promote mitigation in this vulnerable population. Therefore, in this study, we aimed to determine the prevalence of depression and anxiety among emergency department doctors in Libya.

**METHODS**

**Study design and interventions**

**Participants**

The study participants were emergency doctors serving in Libyan hospitals for at least 3 months. Written consent was obtained before the completion of the survey. Participants with a history of mental health disorders and comorbidities, such as chronic pain, hypertension and diabetes, were excluded. One hundred and fifty emergency department staff who met the criteria were asked to complete an anonymous three-page survey. The participants were approached by the authors by visiting the emergency departments of the hospitals during their shifts. The authors undertook a paper-based questionnaire that contained a participant information sheet along with a study measurement tool, and they asked the participants questions related to the inclusion and exclusion criteria before participating in the study to ensure that they met the criteria of the study. Those who did not return the questionnaire or declined to fill in and respond to the questionnaire were not included in the analysis.

**Protocol**

This cross-sectional survey was conducted between December 2018 and February 2019, in nine main tertiary hospitals with emergency departments in Libya. It is estimated that approximately 300 physicians work in the emergency departments of these Libyan hospitals.

**Measurements**

Information regarding years of experience, exercise regimen and smoking history was recorded. In addition, data on verbal and physical abuse were documented. The standardised Hospital Anxiety and Depression Score (HADS) inventory was selected as a measurement tool for analysing the symptoms of anxiety and depression.\textsuperscript{18 19} HADS is a screening tool with seven items to evaluate each condition. Each item is scored on a 4-point Likert scale of 0 to 3, resulting in a total range of 0 to 21 points. A score of ≤7 is considered as ‘normal’, 8 to 10 as ‘mild’, 11 to 14 as ‘moderate’, and 15 to 21 as ‘severe’ for both the anxiety and depression screenings. A score of 28 is considered a ‘case’ for either condition.\textsuperscript{20 21} The HADS scale has a high level of internal consistency, as designated by a Cronbach’s alpha of 0.83 for the anxiety subscale and 0.82 for the depression subscale.\textsuperscript{19} All participants provided consent prior to participating in the study.

**Statistical analysis**

Anxiety and depression were the main parameters observed in this study, which were tabulated with independent variables. \(\chi^2\) tests were conducted to compare the prevalence of anxiety and depression between the groups. Logistic regression analysis was used to analyse the risk factors for anxiety and depression symptoms. Adjusted ORs and 95% CIs were calculated for variables. Results with p values less than 0.05 were considered statistically significant. The data were analysed using IBM SPSS Statistics V.25 software.

**Participants and public involvement**

No participants were involved in establishing the research question, planning or performing the statistical analyses. No participants were invited to offer guidance on presenting the findings or writing the results. There are no proposals or plans to disseminate the study findings to the study participants.

**Ethical considerations**

All participants provided consent prior to participating in the study without identified data.

**RESULTS**

During the study period, between December 2018 and February 2019, 108 out of 150 (72%) emergency physicians from all levels answered the survey and participated in the study. They had a mean±SD age of 31.2±4.5 years, and were predominantly male (74 out of 108 (68.5%)). In addition, 73 (67.6%) of the physicians were from Tripoli, and the remaining 35 (32.4%) were from other cities. Almost half of them were married (52 out of 108 (48.1%)) and 56 (51.9%) were single (table 1).

The participants had a mean experience of 3.32±3.1 years in emergency departments; 62 (63%) worked one
24 hours shift per week, while the other 38 (35%) worked one 12 hours night or day shift per week.

Overall, 49 (45.4%) physicians reached the cut-off score, indicating a high likelihood of clinically significant depressive symptoms (≥8), and 49 (45.4%) achieved a cut-off score, indicating symptoms of anxiety. The mean anxiety score was 7.2±3.03, with a maximum of 16, while the mean score for depression was 7.3±2.75, with a maximum of 14. Table 2 indicates the grade of anxiety and depression among the study participants.

Among all participants, 49 (45.4%) had both anxiety and depression. There was only one case of severe anxiety, and no cases of severe depression were recorded. Tables 3 and 4 illustrate the associations between demographic and personal characteristics, and the occurrence of anxiety and/or depression.

In terms of violence, 71 (65.7%) physicians reported verbal violence, while 26 (24.1%) reported physical violence or abuse by militias. There was a significant relationship between anxiety and depression scores (p<0.001) and violence.

There were no significant impact of gender (p=0.553), physical exercise (p=0.713) or age (p=0.089) on symptoms of depression. The impact of service years on depression score was significant (p<0.05), with fewer years of experience resulting in a higher prevalence of depression. In addition, smoking was associated with a lower rate of depression (p<0.05). Being threatened, and verbally and physically abused were all associated with a higher prevalence of depression. However, the impact of these characteristics was not significant (p>0.05).

Regarding anxiety, there were no significant impact of gender (p=0.553), age (p=0.093), physical exercise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 Baseline characteristics across the study population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age, median (IQR) (years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male n(%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working in other hospitals n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of experience, mean±SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical exercise n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intent to continue in EM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work shift per week n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 hours day shift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 hours night shift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smoking n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal abuse n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical abuse n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threatening n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EM, emergency medicine.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Logistic regression was performed to ascertain the effects of age, gender, verbal and physical abuse, and threatening, and the likelihood that participants had symptoms of depression or anxiety (p>0.05). Working the night shift was not statistically associated with symptoms of depression or anxiety (p>0.05). Due to the small sample size, there were some difficulties in assessing the direction of influence. In addition, we think that participants were afraid of being stigmatised for having a mental illness; thus, there was a high risk of interviewer bias, because some physicians may not have been willing to declare their mental status due to fear of potential professional discrimination and consequence on both short-term and long-term medical careers.22 Previous studies have indicated that physicians fear such consequences. In one study, only 6% of physicians with mental illness had declared their condition to the licensing state.23 This reluctance to declare their mental status due to fear of potential professional discrimination and consequence on both short-term and long-term medical careers is a need for improved strategies to identify mental health issues and address physicians’ concerns.24

Previous international studies have shown that medical doctors, regardless of their speciality, are at increased risk of depression compared with the general population.25 According to recent reports, this increase is associated with a higher risk of suicide, dropout and burnout (p=0.945), service years (p=0.78) or smoking (p=0.21). Furthermore, being threatened, and verbally and physically abused were not significantly associated with anxiety (p>0.05). Working the night shift was not statistically associated with symptoms of depression or anxiety (p>0.05).
among physicians.\textsuperscript{26,27} Despite the utilisation of different methods to assess depression and anxiety, the estimated prevalence of depression among emergency physicians ranges from 10.7\% to 47\% based on several previous studies, which is in line with the findings of the present study.\textsuperscript{12,13,28,29} Another prospective study conducted using the HADS inventory in Tunisian physicians from different specialties disclosed an anxiety prevalence of 43.6\% and a depression prevalence of 30.5\%.\textsuperscript{30} These findings are similar to our results, particularly given that Tunisia has a socioeconomic status similar to that of Libya. In addition, a study conducted in Saudi Arabia revealed mild-to-moderate depression in 43.3\% and 15.2\% of resident physicians, respectively.\textsuperscript{31} Similar findings are present in other studies, such as from Malaysia, where 28.7\% of emergency physicians had anxiety and 10.7\% had depression.\textsuperscript{12} Likewise, Erdur \textit{et al} found that 15.1\% of Turkish doctors had depression and 14.6\% had anxiety disorders.\textsuperscript{13} Another study conducted among physicians-in-training in Nigeria revealed a depression prevalence of 17.3\%.\textsuperscript{32} Interestingly, emergency physicians in Libya did not report substance use, although the literature supports the notion that emergency physicians usually have higher rates of substance misuse as a mechanism for coping with stress or depression.\textsuperscript{33–35} Consistent with previous reports, the duration of work experience was not linked with the onset of depression or anxiety.\textsuperscript{36}

Emergency doctors in Libya share the same risk factors for depression as doctors in other specialties. However, emergency physicians are at higher risk due to their job circumstances, patient population, working hours and the different types of stressors they face.\textsuperscript{26,37} Among all medical specialities in the USA, emergency medicine has the highest burnout rate (~65\%).\textsuperscript{38,39} In addition to the aforementioned concerns, Libyan physicians experience specific constraints and difficulties due to the ongoing conflict that has increased the risk of verbal and physical abuse by local militias.\textsuperscript{40} Civil war settings have increased the likelihood of verbal abuse and physical assaults, and emergency physicians risk being kidnapped or killed if they do not provide adequate care for militias' patients or their relatives. In addition, there have been several cases where doctors were threatened by weapons to treat patients or their friends, which therefore increased the stress endured by physicians working in the frontline of the civil war. These added factors correspond to higher levels of anxiety and depression in the emergency departments. The stressful conditions and financial crisis that occurred as a consequence of the civil wars may also contribute to these findings.\textsuperscript{40}

Therefore, there is a need to address these concerns by local authorities by implementing strategies to support and protect physicians who are working in emergency departments, such as increasing legal enforcement and increasing security measures for the hospitals. Another protection strategy implies the policy of zero-tolerance toward violence in emergency departments. In addition, the local authorities should start mental health support programmes aiming to provide social and mental support, especially for those working during the civil war or near conflict zones. Although, these risk factors have been reported in previous studies, the risk of abuse was not reported in recent literature in conflict areas such as Libya. The heightened prevalence of depression and anxiety in Libyan emergency physicians should raise the alarm for relevant authorities and the Ministry of Health. This high prevalence can play a significant role in increasing the rate of medical errors, consequently affecting the quality of care provided to patients.\textsuperscript{27,41–43} The effects of anxiety and depression may persist for long periods of time, which can have negative effects on an individual's personal and social life.\textsuperscript{44–46} Moreover, high rates of depression and anxiety impair sleep quality, increase dropout rates, and contribute to suicide among physicians, all of which further exacerbate the problems faced when serving the Libyan population.\textsuperscript{5,7,47,48} Additional research with more complex designs would help to determine the factors that lead to depression and anxiety. Furthermore, studies that focus on behaviour and reported abuse by militias are warranted, because their influence in the emergency departments are of major concern for doctors and staff that work in these stressful environments.

Libyan emergency physicians are at an increased risk of depression and anxiety due to the current civil war and financial crisis. In addition, they are at risk of physical and verbal abuse by militias. Therefore, there is an urgent need for action by authorities to provide mental health support, increase security measures to provide a safer working environment, and provide financial and social support for physicians during their work at the emergency department to ensure that physicians can provide adequate medical services for their patients, and to prevent the potentially catastrophic consequences of their mental health deterioration.

Author affiliations
1Faculty of Medicine, University of Tripoli, Tripoli, Libya
2Mitiga Hospital, Tripoli, Libya
3Tripoli University Hospital, Tripoli, Libya
4Al Omar Askar-Neuro Hospital, Tripoli, Libya
5Mistrata Medical Center, Tripoli, Libya
6Zawia Hospital, Tripoli, Libya
7Tripoli Central Hospital, Tripoli, Libya
8General Surgery, Alkhadra hospital, Tripoli, Libya
9Al Jala Hospital for Trauma and General Surgery, Benghazi, Libya

Twitter Muhammad Elhadi @ElhadiMuhammad, Hafed Abdulwahhab Albashkar @ Hafed and Aliyah Mustafa Alshareef @Aliyah-M-Alshareef

Contributors Conceptualisation: ME, AK, HA and ABM. Data curation: ME, ABM, AE-H and AZ. Formal analysis: ME and HA. Writing - Original draft: ME and HA. Writing - Review and editing: ME, AK, HA, ABM and AZ.

Funding The authors have not declared a specific grant for this research from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient consent for publication Not required.

Ethics approval Ethical approval was obtained from the Bioethics Committee at Biotechnology Research Center of Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research in Libya (Reference number: BEC-BTC G–2020).
REFERENCES


41. Makary MA, Daniel M. Medical error—the third leading cause of death in the US. *BMJ* 2016;353:i2139.


