

BMJ Open is committed to open peer review. As part of this commitment we make the peer review history of every article we publish publicly available.

When an article is published we post the peer reviewers' comments and the authors' responses online. We also post the versions of the paper that were used during peer review. These are the versions that the peer review comments apply to.

The versions of the paper that follow are the versions that were submitted during the peer review process. They are not the versions of record or the final published versions. They should not be cited or distributed as the published version of this manuscript.

BMJ Open is an open access journal and the full, final, typeset and author-corrected version of record of the manuscript is available on our site with no access controls, subscription charges or pay-per-view fees (http://bmjopen.bmj.com).

If you have any questions on BMJ Open's open peer review process please email info.bmjopen@bmj.com

BMJ Open

Level of adherence to antiretroviral therapy and associated factor among HIV infected adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia.

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2021-056009
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	02-Aug-2021
Complete List of Authors:	Zewude, Shimeles; Debre Tabor University, Ajebe, Tewodros
Keywords:	Infectious diseases & infestations < DERMATOLOGY, Adult intensive & critical care < INTENSIVE & CRITICAL CARE, Immunology < THORACIC MEDICINE, Adult intensive & critical care < ANAESTHETICS, Health policy < HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our licence.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which Creative Commons licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

1	Level of adherence to antiretroviral therapy and associated factor among HIV infected
2	adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia.
3	Shimeles Biru Zewude (SB) ^{1*} Tewodros Magegnet Ajebe (TM) ²
4	¹ Department of Midwifery, College of Health Sciences, Debre Tabor University, Debre Tabor,
5	Ethiopia
6	² Department of Midwifery, College Of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, Dessie,
7	Ethiopia
8	1*Corresponding Authors: - Shimeles Biru
9	Shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
10	
11	SB: shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
12	TM: Ajebeteddy@gmail.com
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
 22	

- 23 Abstract
- Objectives: The purpose of this study was to identify levels of adherence to ART drugs and
- 25 factors associated with them in northwest Ethiopia. We hypothesize that in the era of COVID-19
- adherence level to ART among people living with HIV have been jeopardized.
- **Design:** cross-sectional study.
- 28 Setting: the study was conducted in one specialized hospitals and three district hospital found in
- 29 the south Gondar zone, northwest Ethiopia.
- 30 Participants: people living with HIV receiving highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy in South
- 31 Gondar zone public hospitals. 432 adult peoples living with HIV receiving ART in selected public
- 32 hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than 3 month period participated in the study.
- 33 Primary and secondary outcome measures: magnitude of optimal adherence and predictors for
- 34 low level of adherence were assessed.
- Results: among 432 study participants 81.5% (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants were 100%
- 36 adherent by using self-reported data. Determinants of lower adherence included Stigma or
- 37 discrimination (OR, 0.4, p=0.016), missed scheduled clinical visit (OR, 0.45 p=0.034), being on
- anti-TB treatment (OR, 0.45 p=0.01], recent CD4 cells cunt less than 500 cell/mm³ (OR, 0.3
- 39 p=0.023) and patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation (OR, 0.24)
- 40 p=0.027) were factors significantly associated with adherence to ART drugs
- 41 Conclusions: level of adherence was relatively low. Stigma or discrimination, patients who
- 42 missed scheduled clinical visits, patients who had been on anti-TB treatment, respondents whose

recent CD4 cells cunt less than 500 cell/mm³, and patients in WHO clinical stage three were

44 factors significantly affecting the level of adherence.

45 Strength and limitation of this study

- Our measurement of adherence is only based on patients' announcement of missed doses so
 Recall bias and social desirability bias is inherent limitations of our study.
- Self-report is proving to be a less reliable measure of adherence so interpretation needs caution.
 - The study was conducted in four different public hospitals so the finding is widely applicable in the study area.

INTRODUCTION

- 54 HIV/AIDS is one of the pandemic public health problems still affecting many people. At the end
- of 2015, globally 36.7 million people were living with HIV. In the same year, 2.1 million people
- 56 were newly infected by HIV/AIDS and 1.1 million people died from HIV-related causes [1].
- 57 Countries are taking different actions to tackle the HIV/AIDS virus epidemic as well as to improve
- 58 the quality of life among people infected by the virus; one of these was the treatment of the patient
- 59 with antiretroviral therapy (ART) [2].
- 60 Achievement of optimal adherence and patient retention are becoming the greatest challenges in
- 61 the management of HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia. A five-year retrospective medical record review of
- 62 3012 adult patients who were enrolled in therapy at Gondar University Hospital ART clinic
- 63 demonstrated that 31.4% of patients had been lost to follow-up [3]
- 64 Highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) includes complex regimens that require strict
- adherence to complicated treatment schedules due to great concern on treatment-resistant variants

- of HIV that rapidly develop in response to underdosing and intermittent, irregular use of
- 67 antiretroviral agents[4].
- 68 Adherence to multi-drug antiretroviral regimens has been a focus of attention since ART drugs
- 69 introduction owning to their complexity, frequent adverse effects, and chronic nature [5,6].
- 70 To get optimal viral suppression and prevent treatment failure individual should take more than
- 71 95% of prescribed drugs. If once the individual fails to take more than 95% of prescribed drugs
- 72 virologic failure rate will be more than 50% [7,8].
- 73 Luck of optimal adherence to antiretroviral therapy (ART) increases viral resistance, immune
- 74 suppression, and risk for opportunistic infection and death [9,10]. According to a World Health
- 75 Organization (WHO) survey study in developing countries, the HIV drug resistance rate among
- 76 people starting ART ranged from 4.8% in 2007 to 6.8% in 2010[11].
- 77 A large percentage of patients on ART find it difficult to achieve a high level of adherence.
- 78 Previous studies have shown that approximately 12-50% of HIV-positive patients fail to achieve
- 79 optimal adherence [12]. A study conducted in rural Tanzania showed that 70% of the participants
- achieved the desired level of adherence [13]. In Soweto South Africa 88% of patients report more
- 81 than 95% adherence rate and the main reasons given for missing doses were being away from
- 82 home (30%), difficulty with the daily routine (23%), and running out of pills (12%)[14].
- 83 A study done in Addis Ababa city describes that only 73.3% of patients were adherent to ART.
- 84 The study also showed that Stigma, discrimination, and poor relationship with the health care
- 85 provider to be associated with low adherence [15]
- 86 The ability of patients to follow treatment plans optimally is frequently compromised by more
- 87 than one barrier, usually related to different aspects; some of them are the social and economic

- factors, the health care team or/and system, characteristics of the disease, disease therapies and patient-related factors [16].
- 90 A review shows that fear of disclosure, concomitant substance abuse, forgetfulness, suspicions of
- 91 treatment, regimens that are too complicated, number of pills required, decreased quality of life,
- 92 work and family responsibilities, falling asleep, and access to medication were barriers to
- 93 adherence [17].

- 94 Now on the country has developing HIV/AIDS prevention, care strategic plan in an investment
- 95 case approach. This is in line with the three 90's target set by UNAIDS to help end the AIDS
- 96 epidemic by 2030[18]. The target states that 90% of all people receiving ART will have viral
- 97 suppression. The plan and strategic objectives are fruitless if adherence to HAART is not well
- 98 recognized.
- 99 Having a strategy to sustain an optimal level of adherence among people living with HIV is an
- 100 essential step towards ensuring treatment success. So the main purpose of this study is to
- 101 determine the level of adherence and its predictors among people living with HIV who have been
- using HAART. The knowledge will help to evaluate the clinical management strategies and define
- 103 relevant, efficient, acceptable adherence support measures for patients within the health system.

104 MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study setting, design, and periods

- 106 An institution-based cross-sectional study was conducted from August 1, 2020, to January 31,
- 107 2021 in four hospitals found in the south Gondar zone, Amhara region. One hospital was
- 108 specialized hospital (Debre tabor comprehensive specialized hospital) and the other three were
- 109 district hospitals (mekane eyesus hospital, addis zemen hospital and nifas mewchia hospital). All

hospitals provide services related to ART. However; very severe cases may be referred to debretabor comprehensive specialized hospital.

Population

people living with HIV (≥18 years old) receiving highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART) in South Gondar zone public hospitals were the study populations and the study participants were adult people living with HIV (≥18 years old) receiving Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART) in selected public hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than 3 month period.

Sample size calculation

The sample size in this cross-sectional study was determined using a single proportion formula n= $(Za/2)^2pq/d^2$. The minimum sample size required for the study was estimated to be 432 using the above formula where n is the sample size, z is the standard normal deviate set at 1.96 (for 95% confidence level), d margin of error acceptable or measure of precision (taken as 0.035) and p=85.3% taken from the previous study [19] and sample size adjusted by 10% non-response.

124 Operational definitions

Good (optimal) Adherence: when taking all antiretroviral treatment in a correctly prescribed dose in the one week before the study [20].

127 Sampling technique and procedure

The study was conducted in four randomly selected hospitals. Then the possible number of participants in each of the Hospitals of the study area was allocated proportionally based on their patient's flow. Study participants who fulfill the inclusion criteria were included in the study using

a systematic random sampling technique and every 5th interval, patient was recruited in the study based on their order of arrival.

Data collection instruments

The data collection tool was adapted from two main sources. Questionnaire from AIDS Clinical Trial Groups (AACTG)[12] adherence instrument and questionnaire from The Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS (CPCRA)[21]. Other information, including the clinical aspect of the patient, retrieves from patient medical records. Optimal adherence was considered when taken all antiretroviral treatment incorrectly prescribed doses at a right time in the week before the study. Otherwise, it is categorized as non-adherent. If they report having missing doses during the last seven days, the questionnaire asks a range of multiple-choice questions about why they miss their pills. Patients' clinical data such as WHO clinical stage and the CD4 counts were retrieved from their medical records at the ART clinic by using a checklist. Data collection was performed by five-diploma nurses (supervised by three BSC nurses). A two days comprehensive training was given for data collectors and supervisors. The questionnaire was compiled in English and evaluated by experts who had expertise in AIDS care and treatment situations in our country. Five AIDS experts were invited to review the Amharic version of the questionnaire for face validity and readability. The questionnaire had pilot tested on 30(5% of the sample) HIV-infected people. Data collectors were trained to have a common understanding of the objective and the methodology of the research. The investigators were closely supervised the performance of the data collectors daily.

Data entry and editing were performed by EPI info and then exported to SPSS version 23 for analysis. We have computed the Frequencies and percentages of different variables for description as appropriate. Using Chi-square test bivariate analysis of variables was completed with Odds

ratio at 95% confidence interval to assess the presence and degree of association between the dependent and independent variables. All explanatory variables associated with outcome variables with p<0.2 were entered into multivariable logistic regression analysis. Statistically significant associated factors were identified based on a p-value<0.05.

158 Patient and public involvement (PPI)

159 Members of the public were not involved in the study concept or design.

160 RESULTS

Demographic and economic characteristics

A total of 432 HIV-positive participants, who reported using ART were interviewed about their adherence to their medication, giving a response rate of 100%. The population consists of one hundred seventy-two (39.8%) male and two hundred sixty female (60.2%) and 335(77.5%) were urban residents. Out of the total population, 257(50.2%) were in the age group between 25-34 years and the mean age of study participants was 30.6±8 years. The majority of participants 322(74.5%) were married. From the total population 211(48.8%) participants were government employees and the majority of patient's monthly income full between more or equal to 1000 Ethiopian birr (table 1).

Family and clinical related characteristics

Out of the total population, 255(59%) of patients disclose their serostatus. From the overall population, only 45(10.4%) of participants were got ever stigma and discrimination. Of 432 participants, 81(18.8%) of them use complementary medicine in addition to their ART drugs.

Regular mealtimes 193(44.7%) was the most common reminder (**Table 2**).

Adherence and health care service characteristics

Based on the patient's self-report 81.5 % (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants had optimal adherence level (take their entire daily dose) one week before the interview. The reason given for missing their treatment was forgetting 31 (7.1%) and being away from home 19 (4.4%). Only 46(10.6%) of study participants miss the scheduled clinical visit and 104(24.1%) patients were taking drugs other than their ART medicine (table 3)

Factors associated with adherence to ART

Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to non-stigmatized and non-discriminated patients [AOR=0.4, 95%CI (0.2-0.84)]. Patients who missed scheduled clinical visits were 55% less likely to adhere to their ART treatment compared to patients who didn't miss scheduled clinical visits 55%[AOR=0.45(0.21-0.94)]. Patients who had been on anti-TB treatment have been 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who had no anti-TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. Respondents whose recent CD4 cells cunt less than 500 cells/mm³ were 70% less likely to adhere to treatment compared to respondents whose CD4 count was greater than 500 cells/ mm³ [AOR=0.3(0.14-0.73], patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterpart [AOR=0.24(0.098-0.57)] (table 4).

DISCUSSION

This study focus on the magnitude of ART drug adherence and associated factors in public hospitals in the south Gondar zone. This study found that 81.5 % of participants were having an

optimal adherence rate based on a one-week recall before the actual interview. This is far less than finding in southwest Ethiopia where 95% of the patients were adherent with \geq 95% (optimal) of prescribed doses in the last 7 days [22] and northeast Ethiopia where 95.5% were taking all their medication [23]. Comparably higher than found in Tanzania (70%) of the participants achieved the desired level of adherence [13]. Other studies conducted in northeastern Ethiopia explain that the adherence rate was found to be 71.8% in the past seven days of respondents' recall of missed doses [24]. But it is almost consistent with study findings in Addis Ababa reporting 82.8% adherence of patients had optimal adherence [25].

to ART treatment compared to patients who had not been stigmatized or discriminated against.

Stigma and discrimination are major obstacles leading to reduced treatment-seeking behavior and ineffective HIV/AIDS prevention and care, especially in sub-Saharan Africa [26]. Patients often missed their doses as a result of fear of being identified as HIV-positive.

Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% [AOR0.4, 75%CI (0.2-0.84) less likely to adhere

Patients who missed appointments were 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who didn't miss appointments [AOR=0.4595%CI (0.21-0.94)]. Achievement of optimal adherence and patient retention are becoming the greatest challenges in the management of HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia. A five-year retrospective medical record review of 3012 adult patients who were enrolled in therapy at Gondar University Hospital ART clinic demonstrated that 31.4% had been lost to follow-up [3]. Study in Uganda found that patients on ART that missed their appointments were more likely to miss their doses compared to those that did not miss scheduled appointment [27]. Suboptimal retention in care is associated with lower ART receipt and worse biological outcomes, including higher viral load, which can contribute to increased infectivity and transmission [28, 29]. Emerging system and individual level literature that describes the influence

of patient satisfaction, health care empowerment, patient-provider relationships, and clinical interactions on retention in care also shows promise for improving appointment attendance, and for implementation of retention interventions at multiple levels [3, 30].

Patients who had been on anti-TB treatment have been 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who didn't have anti-TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. A cross-sectional study found high levels of non-adherence (42.4%) among patients after 1 month of concurrent treatment(TB and HIV treatment) [31]. We found that patients were more frequently adhere to TB treatment compared to ART. This finding might be due to the shorter duration that a patient must take TB treatment compared to life-long ART but may also suggest that the preference for ART may be diminished when patients are receiving integrated TB/HIV treatment support[32].

Respondents whose recent CD4 cunt less than 500 cell/mm³ were 70% less likely adhere to treatment compared to respondent whose CD4 count greater than 500 cell/mm³ [AOR=0.3,95%CI,(0.14-0.73]. Consistently high levels of adherence were an important determinant of virologic and immunologic outcomes. Study shows that CD4 cell count was increased by 179, 159, and 53 cells/mm³ among the groups with 100%, 80%–99%, and 0%–79% adherence level respectively [33]. A review conducted in a developing country found that the likelihood of the treatment failure was almost 5 times higher among patients with CD4 < 200 cells/mm³ compared to those with CD4 ≥ 200 CD4 cells/mm³[34]. As CD4 cell count increases, viral replication decreases, which means it has an inverse relationship with viral load. As patients' immune status drops, and the rate of viral load increases compared to the immune competent individuals with HIV infection. In addition, users with compromised immunity are more susceptible to different opportunistic infections that endure the cruel cycle of immunity depletion

and viral replication [35]. Patients who had been on WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterparts. It has been proven that HAART is effective in suppressing human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) replication, decreasing morbidity and mortality associated with HIV, suppressing development and spread of ART drug-resistant HIV, and improving quality of life in adults as well as children infected with HIV. However, drugs don't work in patients who don't take them properly so that optimum adherence to HAART is critical to the successful outcome of patients receiving therapy [7, 8].

CONCLUSIONS

250 This study demonstrated that level of adherence was relatively low compared with other local studies. Stigma or discrimination, missing schedule clinical visits, being in anti-TB treatment, recent CD4 cells cunt less than 500 cell/mm³, and patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were factors associated with adherence to ART drugs. The establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system during clinical visits helps to achieve optimal adherence.

ABBREVIATIONS

- 256 AACTG: Adult AIDS Clinical Trial Groups; AIDS: Acquired immune deficiency syndrome;
- 257 ART: Antiretro Viral therapy; ARV: Antiretroviral;; CD4: Cluster differentiation; CPCRA:
- 258 Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS, HIV: human immunodeficiency; HAART:
- 259 highly active antiretroviral therapy UNAIDS: United Nation Acquired Immune Deficiency
- 260 Syndrome WHO: world health organization.

261 Ethics approval and consent to participate

Ethical approval letter was obtained from the institutional review board of Wollo university college of medicine and health Sciences (no: 0156/CMHS/IRB/2020). Official Permission letter was obtained from the south Gondar zone Health Department and each hospital. The objective of the study was explained to all study subjects to obtain their verbal or written consent before the interview. Participants were informed that they had the full right to discontinue participating in the study if they felt discomfort. They were also assured that all the data provided by them would be kept confidential. In addition, no personal identifiers were used.

9 Consent for publication

270 Not required.

271 Availability of data and materials

- Full data set and other materials pertaining to this study can be obtained from corresponding
- 273 author on reasonable request.

274 Funding

- 275 This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or
- 276 not-for-profit sectors.

277 Competing interests

278 None.

279 Acknowledgments

We would like to thank the south Gondar zone HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Office. We are also grateful to the data collectors and professionals working in the ART clinic for facilitating the

Contributors

data collection.

SB conceives the research project, develops the proposal, supervised the data collection process, conducts the analysis, and wrote the manuscript. TM develops the proposal, supervised data collection, was involved in data analysis, and wrote the manuscript. Both authors read and

REFERENCES

approved the final manuscript.

- 1. World health Organization. AIDS by the numbers 2015: WHO, Geneva switzerland.
- 290 2. Ramos, Jr., Alberto, NM., Luiza H., Norman H. AIDS in Brazilian children: history, 291 surveillance, antiretroviral therapy, and epidemiologic transition, 1984–2008. AIDS patient 292 care and STDs, 2011. 25(4): p. 245-255.
- 3. Wubshet,M., Berhane, Y., Worku,A., Kebede,Y., Diro,E. High loss to followup and early mortality create substantial reduction in patient retention at antiretroviral treatment program in north-west Ethiopia. Isrn aids, 2012. 2012.
- UNAIDs and world health Organization, Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic update and health
 sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011. Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic
 update and health sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011.
- 5. Paterson, DL., Swindells, S., Mohr, J., Brester, M., Vergis, EN, Squier, C., et al., Adherence to protease inhibitor therapy and outcomes in patients with HIV infection. Annals of internal medicine, 2000. 133(1): p. 21-30.

- 302 6. Deleuze, J., Sicard, D., Coste, J., Guerin. Enquête sur l'observance des traitements
- antirétroviraux comportant un inhibiteur de protéase chez les patients infectés par le VIH. in
- Annales de médecine interne (Paris). 2000.
- 305 7. Guidelines for paediatric HIV/AIDS care and treatment in Ethiopia. HIV/AIDS Prevention and
- 306 Control Office Addis Ababa,2008
- 8. Shah, CA. Adherence to high activity antiretrovial therapy (HAART) in pediatric patients infected
- with HIV: issues and interventions. The Indian Journal of Pediatrics, 2007. 74(1): p. 55.
- 9. Esteban, MG., Rodríguez, MJ., Vicario Z., Herreros DA. Influence of antiretroviral therapy
- characteristics on pediatric patient adherence. Farmacia hospitalaria: organo oficial de
- expresion cientifica de la Sociedad Espanola de Farmacia Hospitalaria, 2004. 28(6 Suppl 1):
- p. 34-39.

- 313 10. Malee, K., Williams, P., Montepiedra, G., McCabe, M., Nichols, S., Sirois, PA., et al.,
- Medication adherence in children and adolescents with HIV infection: associations with
- behavioral impairment. AIDS patient care and STDs, 2011. 25(3): p. 191-200.
- 316 11. World Health Organization. The HIV drug resistance report(2012), Geneva; switzerland.
- 12. Chesney, MA., Ickovics, JR., Chambers, DB., Gifford, AL., Neidig, J., Zwickl, B., et al.,
- Self-reported adherence to antiretroviral medications among participants in HIV clinical
- trials: the AACTG adherence instruments. AIDS care, 2000. 12(3): p. 255-266.
- 320 13. Nyogea, D., et al., Determinants of antiretroviral adherence among HIV positive children and
- teenagers in rural Tanzania: a mixed methods study. BMC infectious diseases, 2015. 15(1): p. 28.
- 322 14. Nachega, JB., Mtenga, S., Henning, L., Franzeck, FC., Glass, TR., Letang, E. et al.,
- Adherence to antiretroviral therapy in HIV-infected adults in Soweto, South Africa. AIDS
- Research & Human Retroviruses, 2004. 20(10): p. 1053-1056.

- 325 15. Mengistu, Z., and Chere,A. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and its associated factors among
- people living with HIV/AIDS in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian medical journal, 2012. 50(4): p.
- 327 355-361.
- 328 16. Vitoria, MS., Vella,S., and Ford,N. Scaling up antiretroviral therapy in resource-limited settings:
- adapting guidance to meet the challenges. Current Opinion in HIV and AIDS, 2013. 8(1): p. 12-18.
- 17. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Buchan, I., Orbinski, J., Attaran, A., Singh, S., et al., Adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy in Sub-Saharan Africa and North America. A Meta-analysis. JAMA,
- 332 2006. 296(6): p. 679-690.
- 18. 90-90-90 An ambitious treatment target to help end the AIDS epidemic,
- 334 2017.
- 335 19. Tadesse, S., Tadesse, A., Wubshet, M. adherence to antiretroviral treatment and associated factors
- among people living with hiv/aids in northwest ethiopia. J trop dis. 2014;**2**(133):2
- 20. Letta, S., Demissie, A., Oljira, L., and Dessie, Y. Factors associated with adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) among adult people living with HIV and attending their
- clinical care, Eastern Ethiopia. BMC International health and human rights, 2015 15(1), pp.1-
- 340 7.
- 341 21. Mannheimer, S., Friedland, G., Matts, J., Child, C., Chesney, M. The consistency of
- adherence to antiretroviral therapy predicts biologic outcomes for Human Immunodeficiency
- Virus—infected persons in clinical trials. Clinical infectious diseases, 2002. 34(8): p. 1115-
- 344 1121.
- 345 22. Tiyou, A, Belachew, T., Alemseged, F., Biadgilign, S. Predictors of adherence to
- antiretroviral therapy among people living with HIV/AIDS in resource-limited setting of
- southwest Ethiopia. AIDS research and therapy. 2010 Dec; 7(1):1-0.

- 348 23. Ketema, AK., and Weret, ZS. Assessment of adherence to highly active antiretroviral
- therapy and associated factors among people living with HIV at Debre brihan Referral
- Hospital and Health Center, Northeast Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. HIV/AIDS
- 351 (Auckland, NZ). 2015;7:75.

- 352 24. Legesse., TA., and Reta MA. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and associated factors
- among people living with HIV/AIDS in Hara town and its surroundings, North-Eastern
- Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Ethiopian journal of health sciences. 2019;29(3).
- 355 25. Awel, M. Antiretroviral adherence and its detriments among people living with HIV/AIDS on highly
- active antiretroviral therapy in two hospitals of ormoyia regional state. Ethiopia. Ethiopian Public
- Health Association (EPHA) extract from EPHA—sponsored Master Thesis on HIV/AIDS exrtarctno,
- 358 2008. 4: p. 9-19.
- 359 26. Maman, S., Abler, L., Parker, L., Lane, T., Chirowodza, A., Ntogwisangu, J., t al., A
- 360 comparison of HIV stigma and discrimination in five international sites: The influence of
- care and treatment resources in high prevalence settings. Social Science & Medicine, 2009.
- 362 68(12): p. 2271-2278.
- 363 27. Shumba, C., Atuhaire, L., Imakit, R., Atukunda, R., Memiah, P. Missed doses and missed
- appointments: adherence to ART among adult patients in Uganda. International Scholarly
- 365 Research Notices. 2013;2013.
- 366 28. Nieuwkerk, PT., and Oort, FJ. Self-reported adherence to antiretroviral therapy for HIV-1
- infection and virologic treatment response: a meta-analysis. JAIDS Journal of Acquired
- 368 Immune Deficiency Syndromes, 2005. 38(4): p. 445-448.
- 29. Zinski, A., Westfall, AO., Gardner, LI., Giordano, TP., Wilson, TE., Drainoni, ML., et al.
- The contribution of missed clinic visits to disparities in HIV viral load outcomes. American
- iournal of public health. 2015 Oct; 105(10): 2068-75.

- 30. Alemu, H., Haile Mariam, D., Tsui, AO., Shewamare, A. Correlates of highly active
- antiretroviral therapy adherence among urban Ethiopian clients. African Journal of AIDS
- 374 Research, 2011. 10(3): p. 263-270.
- 31. Monjok, E., Smesny, A., Okokon, IB., Mgbere, O., Essien, EJ. Adherence to antiretroviral
- therapy in Nigeria: an overview of research studies and implications for policy and practice.
- 377 HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ), 2010. 2: p. 69.
- 378 32. Zinski, A., Westfall, AO., Gardner, LI., Giordano, TP., Wilson, TE., Drainoni, ML., et al.
- The contribution of missed clinic visits to disparities in HIV viral load outcomes. American
- journal of public health. 2015 Oct;105(10):2068-75.
- 33. Hogg, RS., Heath, K., Bangsberg, D., Yip, B., Press, N., O'Shaughnessy., et al., Intermittent
- use of triple-combination therapy is predictive of mortality at baseline and after 1 year of
- follow-up. Aids, 2002. 16(7): p. 1051-1058.
- 34. Lailulo, Y., Kitenge, M., Jaffer, S., Aluko, O., Nyasulu, PS. Factors associated with
- antiretroviral treatment failure among people living with HIV on antiretroviral therapy in
- resource-poor settings: a systematic review and metaanalysis. Systematic Reviews. 2020
- 387 Dec;9(1):1-7.
- 388 35. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Bangsberg, DR., Singh, S., Rachlis, B., Wu, P., et al., Adherence to
- 389 HAART: a systematic review of developed and developing nation patient-reported barriers
- and facilitators. PLoS medicine, 2006. 3(11).

Table 1: demographic and economic characteristics of the study participants in south

392 Gondar zone, August 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)

variables	Frequency(n=432)	Percentage (%)
sex		
male	172	39.8

	female	260	60.2
Place of residence			
	urban	335	77.5
	rural	97	22.5
Aage			
	18-24	103	23.8
	25-34	217	50.2
	35-45	70	16.3
	>45	42	9.7
Monthly income			
	<1000	79	18.3
	≥1000	353	81.7
Educational status			
	Primary level of education	55	12.7
	Secondary level of education	314	72.7
	College and above	63	14.6

Table 2: family and clinical related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)

	female	260		60.2
Place of residence	e			
	urban	335		77.5
	rural	97		22.5
Aage				
	18-24	103		23.8
	25-34	217		50.2
	35-45	70		16.3
	>45	42		9.7
Monthly income				
	<1000	79		18.3
	≥1000	353		81.7
Educational statu	s			
		<i></i>		12.7
	Primary level of education	55		12.7
	Primary level of education Secondary level of education	314		72.7
Table 2: family	Secondary level of education College and above	63	ants in	72.7 14.6
Gondar zone, Auş	Secondary level of education	314 63 f the study particip		72.7 14.6 south
	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of	314 63 f the study particip		72.7 14.6 south
Gondar zone, Auş	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)	314 63 f the study particip	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south
Gondar zone, Aug variables	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)	314 63 f the study particip Frequency	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentag (%)
Gondar zone, Aug variables	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive	f the study particip Frequency	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentag (%) 52.3
Gondar zone, Aug variables	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive negative	f the study particip Frequency 226 17	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentag (%) 52.3 3.9
Gondar zone, Aug variables Serostatus of sexu	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive negative unknown	f the study particip Frequency 226 17 189	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentag (%) 52.3 3.9 43.7
Gondar zone, Aug variables Serostatus of sexu	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive negative unknown Not-disclosed disclosed	f the study particip Frequency 226 17 189 177	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentag (%) 52.3 3.9 43.7 41
Gondar zone, Aug variables Serostatus of sexu disclosure status	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive negative unknown Not-disclosed disclosed	314 63 f the study particip 2) Frequency 226 17 189 177 255	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentage (%) 52.3 3.9 43.7 41 59.0
Gondar zone, Aug variables Serostatus of sexu disclosure status	Secondary level of education College and above and clinical related characteristics of gust 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432) all partner positive negative unknown Not-disclosed disclosed tus disclosed family	314 63 f the study particip 2) Frequency 226 17 189 177 255 79	v(n=432	72.7 14.6 south Percentage (%) 52.3 3.9 43.7 41 59.0 31

	yes	45	10.4
Do you use complementary medicine	No	351	81.3
incurcinc	Yes	81	18.8
Do you use reminder	No	40	9.3
5	Yes	392	90.7
Base line CD4 count	≤500cells/mm³	51	13.2
	>500cells/mm ³	336	86.8
reatment regimens	tdf+3tc+efv	259	60.0
	azt + 3tc+efv	143	33.1
	azt +3tc +nvp	30	6.9
	tdf +3tc +efv	259	60.0
WHO clinical disease stage of the control of the co	during Stage-I	50	11.6
	Stage-II	352	81.5
	Stage-III	30	6.9
Recent CD4 count	≤500cells/mm ³	87	20.1
Recent CD4 count		87 341	20.1 78.9
Recent CD4 count Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables	\(\leq 500\text{cells/mm}^3 \) \(> 500\text{cells/mm}^3 \) \(\text{th care service related char} \)	341	78.9 participants
Γable 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ Ith care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202	racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432)	78.9 participants
Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ Ith care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202	racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432)	78.9 participants
Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ lth care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days	racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432)	78.9 participants Percentage (%)
Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ Ith care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days No	341 racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432)	78.9 Percentage (%) 81.5
Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ Ith care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days No	341 racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432)	78.9 Percentage (%) 81.5
Table 3: Adherence and heal is south Gondar zone, Augustariables To you miss your dose in the interpretation of missed doses	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ Ith care service related charst 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days No Yes	341 racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432) 352 80	78.9 Percentage (%) 81.5 18.5
Table 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the No of missed doses	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ lth care service related chare at 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days No Yes 1-2 doses 3-4 doses	341 racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432) 352 80 57	78.9 Percentage (%) 81.5 18.5
Fable 3: Adherence and heal n south Gondar zone, Augus Variables Do you miss your dose in the No of missed doses Reason for missing to take A	≤500cells/mm³ >500cells/mm³ lth care service related chare at 1, 2020 to January 31 202 last 7days No Yes 1-2 doses 3-4 doses	341 racteristics of the study 1 (n = 432) Frequencies(n=432) 352 80 57	78.9 Percentage (%) 81.5 18.5

Table 3: Adherence and health care service related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)

Variables		Frequencies(n=432)	Percentage (%)
Do you miss your dose in	the last 7days		
	No	352	81.5
	Yes	80	18.5
No of missed doses			
	1-2 doses	57	13.2
	3-4 doses	23	5.3
Reason for missing to take	e ART medication		
	Away from home	19	23.75
	forgot	31	38.75

	Busy with other things	12	15
	sickness	18	22.5
Missed scheduled clinica	l visit		
	No	386	89.4
	Yes	46	10.6
Do you take Drugs other	than ARV		
	No	328	75.9
	Yes	104	24.1

Table 4: Factors associated with ART adherence among adult patients on ART in public health institutions in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020 to January 31, 2021.

	Busy with other thing	s 1	2	15	
	sickness	1	8	22.5	
Missed scheduled clir	nical visit				
	No		386	89.4	
	Yes		46	10.6	
Do you take Drugs ot					
,	No		328	75.9	
	Yes		104	24.1	
	ociated with ART adherer	t 1, 2020 to	January 31, 202	21.	
		t 1, 2020 to	_	21.	р-
	south Gondar zone, Augus Adherence	e to ARV	January 31, 202	21.	
	south Gondar zone, Augus	e to ARV	January 31, 202	21.	р-
health institutions in	south Gondar zone, Augus Adherence	e to ARV	January 31, 202	21.	р-
health institutions in	Adherence adherent	e to ARV Non- adherent	January 31, 202	AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	Adherence adherent no 275	e to ARV	January 31, 202 COR(95%CI)	21. AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77	e to ARV Non- adherent	January 31, 202	AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77	e to ARV Non- adherent	January 31, 202 COR(95%CI)	21. AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77 ion patients on ART	Non-adherent 53 27	January 31, 202 COR(95%CI)	AOR(95%CI) 1 1.14(0.53-2.45)	р-
drug other than ARV	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77 ion patients on ART no 326 yes 26	Non-adherent 53 27	January 31, 202 COR(95%CI) 1 0.55(0.3-0.9)	AOR(95%CI) 1 1.14(0.53-2.45)	p- value
drug other than ARV	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77 ion patients on ART no 326 yes 26	Non-adherent 53 27	January 31, 202 COR(95%CI) 1 0.55(0.3-0.9)	AOR(95%CI) 1 1.14(0.53-2.45)	p- value
health institutions in	Adherence adherent no 275 yes 77 cion patients on ART no 326 yes 26 cal visit	Non-adherent 53 27 61 16	COR(95%CI) 1 0.55(0.3-0.9) 1 0.26(0.13-0.5)	AOR(95%CI) 1 1.14(0.53-2.45) 1 0.4(0.2-0.84)	p- value
	adherent no 275 yes 77 ion patients on ART no 326 yes 26 eal visit no 325	Non-adherent 53 27 61 16	COR(95%CI) 1 0.55(0.3-0.9) 1 0.26(0.13-0.5)	AOR(95%CI) 1 1.14(0.53-2.45) 1 0.4(0.2-0.84) 1	p- value

WHO clinical sta	<500 cells/mm ³	27 e of ART	17 initiation	0.23(0.12-0.56)	0.3(0.14-0.73)	0.007
	Stage-I	42	8	1		
	Stage-II	291	61	0.208(0.68-0.633))	
	Stage-III	12	11	0.23(0.1-0.55)	0.24(0.098-0.57)	0.027

BMJ Open

Magnitude of optimal adherence and predictors for a low level of adherence among HIV/AIDS infected adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia: A multi-facility cross-sectional study

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2021-056009.R1
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	17-Oct-2021
Complete List of Authors:	Zewude, Shimeles; Debre Tabor University, Ajebe, Tewodros ; Wollo University
Primary Subject Heading :	HIV/AIDS
Secondary Subject Heading:	Global health, Infectious diseases, Nursing, Public health, Sexual health
Keywords:	HIV & AIDS < INFECTIOUS DISEASES, PUBLIC HEALTH, Adverse events < THERAPEUTICS, Quality in health care < HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our licence.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which Creative Commons licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

1	Magnitude of optimal adherence and predictors for a low level of adherence among
2	HIV/AIDS infected adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia: A multi-facility
3	cross-sectional study
4	Shimeles Biru Zewude (SB) ^{1*} Tewodros Magegnet Ajebe (TM) ²
5	¹ Department of Midwifery, College of Health Sciences, Debre Tabor University, Debre Tabor,
6	Ethiopia
7	² Department of Midwifery, College Of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, Dessie,
8	Ethiopia
9	1*Corresponding Authors: - Shimeles Biru
10	Shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
11	
12	SB: shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
13	TM: Ajebeteddy@gmail.com
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

- 23 Abstract
- Objectives: This study aims to identify levels of adherence to ART drugs and factors associated
- 25 with them in northwest Ethiopia. We hypothesize that in the era of covid -19 there would be
- suboptimal adherence to ART drugs.
- **Design:** An observational cross-sectional study was conducted. Factors associated with the level
- of adherence were selected for multiple logistic regressions at a p-value of less than 0.2 in the
- analysis. Statistically significant associated factors were identified at a p-value less than 0.05 and
- adjusted OR (AOR) with a 95% CI.
- **Setting**: the study was conducted in one specialized hospital and three district hospitals found in
- 32 the south Gondar zone, northwest Ethiopia.
- Participants: About 432 people living with HIV/AIDS receiving HAART in South Gondar zone
- 34 public hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than three months period participated in
- 35 the study.
- 36 Primary and secondary outcome measures: levels of adherence to ART drugs and their
- 37 associated factors.
- **Results:** among 432 study participants 81.5% (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants had optimally
- 39 adherent to ART drugs. Determinants of lower adherence included Stigma or discrimination (OR,
- 40 0.4, p=0.016), missed scheduled clinical visit (OR, 0.45 p=0.034), being on TB treatment (OR,
- 41 0.45 p=0.01], recent CD4 cells count less than 500 cell/mm³ (OR, 0.3 p=0.023) and patients who
- 42 had been a WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation (OR, 0.24 p=0.027) were
- 43 factors significantly associated with adherence to ART drugs.

Conclusions: level of adherence was relatively low compared with some locale studies. The
intervention targeted to reduce discrimination, counseling before initiation of treatment, and
awareness regarding compliance is advised to improve adherence to antiretroviral regimens.

Limitation of this study

Our measurement of adherence is based on patients' announcement of missed doses, Recall esirability b.s. bias and social desirability bias is inherent limitations of our study.

INTRODUCTION

- 65 HIV/AIDS is one of the pandemic public health problems still affecting many people. At the end
- of 2020, globally 37.7 million people globally were living with HIV. In the same year, 1.5 million
- 67 people were newly infected by the virus and 680000 people died from AIDS-related illnesses [1].
- 68 Countries are taking different actions to tackle the HIV/AIDS virus epidemic as well as to improve
- 69 the quality of life among people infected by the virus; one of these was the treatment of the patient
- 70 with ART therapy [2].
- 71 Achievement of optimal adherence and patient retention are becoming the greatest challenges in
- 72 the management of HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia. A five-year retrospective medical record review of
- 73 3012 adult patients who were enrolled in therapy at Gondar University Hospital ART clinic
- 74 demonstrated that 31.4% of patients had been lost to follow-up [3].
- 75 Highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) includes complex regimens that require strict
- 76 adherence to complicated treatment schedules due to great concern on treatment-resistant variants
- 77 of HIV that rapidly develop in response to underdosing and intermittent, irregular use of
- 78 antiretroviral agents[4].
- 79 Adherence to multi-drug antiretroviral regimens has been a focus of attention since ART drugs
- 80 introduction owning to their complexity, frequent adverse effects, and chronic nature [5,6].
- 81 To get optimal viral suppression and prevent treatment failure individual should take more than
- 82 95% of prescribed drugs. If once the individual fails to take more than 95% of prescribed drugs
- 83 virologic failure rate will be more than 50% [7,8].
- 84 Luck of optimal adherence to antiretroviral therapy (ART) increases viral resistance, immune
- 85 suppression, and risk for opportunistic infection and death [9,10]. According to a World Health

- 86 Organization (WHO) survey study in developing countries, the HIV drug resistance rate among
- 87 people starting ART ranged from 4.8% in 2007 to 6.8% in 2010[11].
- 88 A large percentage of patients on ART find it difficult to achieve a high level of adherence.
- 89 Previous studies have shown that approximately 12-50% of HIV-positive patients fail to achieve
- 90 optimal adherence [12]. A study conducted in rural Tanzania showed that 70% of the participants
- 91 achieved the desired level of adherence [13]. In Soweto South Africa 88% of patients report more
- 92 than 95% adherence rate and the main reasons given for missing doses were being away from
- 93 home (30%), difficulty with the daily routine (23%), and running out of pills (12%)[14].
- 94 A study done in Addis Ababa city describes that among patients on ART drugs, 73.3% of
- 95 participants had an optimal level of adherence. Stigma, discrimination, and poor relationship with
- 96 health care providers were predictors for a suboptimal level of adherence [15].
- 97 The ability of patients to follow treatment plans optimally is frequently compromised by more
- 98 than one barrier, usually related to different aspects; some of them are the social and economic
- 99 factors, the health care team or/and system, characteristics of the disease, disease therapies and
- 100 patient-related factors [16].
- 101 A review shows that fear of disclosure, concomitant substance abuse, forgetfulness, suspicions of
- treatment, regimens that are too complicated, number of pills required, decreased quality of life,
- 103 work and family responsibilities, falling asleep, and access to medication were barriers to
- 104 adherence [17].

- Now on the country has developing HIV/AIDS prevention, care strategic plan in an investment
- 106 case approach. This is in line with the three 90's target set by UNAIDS to help end the AIDS
- 107 epidemic by 2030[18]. The target states that 90% of all people receiving ART will have viral

108	suppression. The plan and strategic objectives are fruitless if adherence to HAART is not well
109	recognized.
110	Currently, our world including Ethiopia has been struggling to prevent and control a new
111	pandemic disease called SARS-COV-2 however, chronic diseases like HIV/AIDS were put aside
112	especially in developing countries. We hypothesize that there may be suboptimal adherence to
113	ART drugs among people living with HIV. Having a strategy to sustain an optimal level of
114	adherence among people living with HIV is an essential step towards ensuring treatment success
115	The knowledge would help to evaluate the clinical management strategies and define relevant
116	efficient, acceptable adherence support measures for patients within the health system. So the
117	main purpose of this study was to determine the level of adherence and its predictors among
118	people living with HIV who have been using HAART.

Therefore, this observational study hypothesize that in the era of covid -19 there would be

suboptimal adherence to ART drugs among people living with HIV/AIDS.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

132 Study setting, design, and periods

A multicenter facility-based observational cross-sectional study was conducted from August to January 2021 in the south Gondar zone, Amhara region. South Gondar zone is divided into 19 woredas and structured with one general hospital, seven primary hospitals. All of them are providing ART care and treatment for its consumer. In the zone, there is 6870 HIV/AIDS infected patient enrolled in ART care and treatment. In this study, four public hospitals were selected randomly which provide ART care and treatment for HIV/AIDS infected people.

Population

people living with HIV/AIDS (≥18 years old) receiving HAART in South Gondar zone public hospitals were the study populations and the study participants were adult people living with HIV/AIDS (≥18 years old) treated as out-patients in selected public hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than three month period.

Eligibility criteria

HIV/AIDS infected people whose age greater than or equal to eighteen years, PLHIV who have been on treatment for more than three month period and continuing their ART during the study period were eligible for this study.

Sampling technique and procedure

The study was conducted in four randomly selected hospitals. Then the possible number of participants in each of the Hospitals of the study area was allocated proportionally based on their patient's flow. Using the eligibility criteria each study participant was included in the study and a systematic random sampling technique (every 5th interval) was applied based on their order of arrival in the ART clinic.

Explanatory variables

Socio-demographic (age, educational status, residence, marital status), personal and family-related (disclosure of serostatus, stigma, and discrimination, use of complementary medicine), medication-related (drug other than ARV, patients on ART, missed scheduled clinical visit), clinical (Patients on TB treatment), immunological factors (Recent CD4 count, WHO clinical stage) were factors included in the regression analysis.

Data collection instruments

The data collection tool was adapted from two main sources. Questionnaire from AIDS Clinical Trial Groups (AACTG) [12] adherence instrument which measured level of adherence based on patients self-report. A questionnaire from the Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS (CPCRA) [19] was used to collect other information including the clinical aspect of the patient. Taking all antiretroviral treatment at a right time in the week before the study was a cutoff value to consider optimal adherence to the ART medication. Otherwise, it is categorized as non-adherent. If they report having missing doses during the last seven days, the questionnaire asks a range of multiple-choice questions about why they miss their pills. Patients' clinical data such as WHO clinical stage and the CD4 counts were extracted from their medical records at the ART clinic by using a checklist which was adapted from different literature. Data collection was performed by five diploma nurses (supervised by three BSC nurses). A two days comprehensive training was given for data collectors and supervisors. The questionnaire was compiled in English and evaluated by experts who had expertise in AIDS care and treatment situations in our country. Five AIDS experts were invited to review the Amharic version (local language) of the questionnaire for face validity and readability. The questionnaire had pilot tested on 30(5% of the sample) HIV-infected people. It was reported reliable and valid with 0.83α -Cronbach, shows high level of internal consistency, 85% general inter-observer agreement, 78% sensitivity, and 95% specificity, so it had been appropriate and easy to understand by participants. Data collectors were trained to have a common understanding of the objective and the methodology of the research. The investigators were closely supervised the performance of the data collectors daily.

Operational definitions

- 184 Good (optimal) Adherence: when taking all antiretroviral treatment in a correctly prescribed dose
- in the one week before the study [20].

Sample size calculation

The sample size in this cross-sectional study was determined using a single proportion formula n= $(Za/2)^2pq/d^2$. The minimum sample size required for the study was estimated to be 432 using the above formula where n is the sample size, z is the standard normal deviate set at 1.96 (for 95% confidence level), d margin of error acceptable or measure of precision (taken as 0.035) and p=85.3% taken from the previous study [21] and sample size adjusted by 10% non-response.

2 Statistical analysis

Data entry and analysis were done by using Epi info V.7.1 and SPSS V.23 respectively. We have computed the Frequencies and percentages of different variables for description as appropriate.

Using Chi-square test bivariate analysis of variables was completed with Odds ratio at 95% confidence interval to assess the presence and degree of association between the dependent and independent variables. We hypothesize that there would be suboptimal adherence to ART drugs among people living with HIV so a one-tailed p-value was applied. Explanatory variables

associated with outcome variables with p<0.2 were entered into multivariable logistic regression analysis. Statistically significant associated factors were identified based on a p-value<0.05.

Patient and public involvement (PPI)

2 Members of the public were not involved in the study concept or design.

RESULTS

Demographic and economic characteristics

A total of 432 HIV-positive patients, who reported using ART were interviewed about adherence to their medication, giving a response rate of 100%. The population consists of one hundred seventy-two (39.8%) male and two hundred sixty female (60.2%) and 335(77.5%) were urban residents. Out of the total population, 217(50.2%) were in the age group between 25-34 years and the mean age of study participants was 30.6±8 years. The majority of participants 322(74.5%) were married. From the total population 211(48.8%) participants were government employees and the majority of patients' monthly income was more or equal to 1000 Ethiopian birr (table 1).

Family and clinical related characteristics

Out of the total population, 255(59%) of patients disclose their serostatus. From the overall population, only 45(10.4%) of participants were stigmatized and/or discriminated by their family, friends, or community. Of 432 study participants, 81(18.8%) were using traditional medicine in addition to their ART drugs. Regular mealtimes 193(44.7%) was the most common reminder (Table 2).

Adherence and health care service characteristics

Based on the patient's self-report 81.5 % (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants had optimal adherence level (take their entire daily dose) one week before the interview. The reason given for missing their treatment was forgetting 31 (7.1%) and 19 (4.4%) being away from home. Only 46(10.6%) of study participants miss the scheduled clinical visit and 104(24.1%) patients were taking drugs other than their ART medicine (table 3)

Factors associated with adherence to ART

Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to non-stigmatized and non-discriminated patients [AOR=0.4, 95%CI (0.2-0.84)]. Patients who missed scheduled clinical visits were 55% less likely to adhere to their ART treatment compared to patients who didn't miss scheduled clinical visits 55%[AOR=0.45(0.21-0.94)]. Patients who had been on TB treatment have been 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who had no TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. Respondents whose recent CD4 cells count, less than 500 cells/mm³ were 70% less likely to adhere to treatment compared to respondents whose CD4 count was greater than 500 cells/ mm³ [AOR=0.3(0.14-0.73]. patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterpart [AOR=0.24(0.098-0.57)] (table 4).

engaged in treatment [27].

1 DISCUSSION

This study focus on the magnitude of ART drug adherence and associated factors in public hospitals in the south Gondar zone. This study found that 81.5 % of participants were having an optimal adherence based on a one-week recall before the actual interview. This is far less than finding in southwest Ethiopia where 95% of the patients were adherent with > 95% (optimal) of prescribed doses in the last 7 days [22] and northeast Ethiopia where 95% were taking all their medication [23]. Comparably higher than found in Tanzania (70%) of the participants achieved the desired level of adherence [13]. Other studies conducted in northeastern Ethiopia explain that the adherence rate was found to be 71.8% in the past seven days of respondents' recall of missed doses [24]. But it is almost consistent with a study finding in Addis Ababa reporting 82.8% of patients had optimal adherence [25]. Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% [AOR0.4, 75%CI (0.2-0.84) less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who had not been stigmatized or discriminated. Stigma and discrimination are major obstacles leading to reduced treatment-seeking behavior and ineffective HIV/AIDS prevention and care, especially in sub-Saharan Africa [26]. Patients often missed their doses as a result of fear of being identified as HIV-positive. A systematic review conducted among 26,715 HIV-positive persons in 32 countries found that HIV-related stigma compromised ART adherence, primarily by undermining social support and adaptive coping. The study reveals the importance of social ties in promoting adherence, particularly in resource-limited settings, and reflects the centrality of social integration to the experience of HIV-positive persons

Patients who had been on TB treatment have been 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who didn't have TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. A cross-sectional study found high levels of non-adherence (42.4%) among patients after 1 month of concurrent treatment (TB and HIV treatment) [28]. Patients were more frequently adhere to TB treatment compared to ART. This might be due to the shorter duration that a patient must take TB treatment compared to life-long ART but may also suggest that the preference for ART may be diminished when patients are receiving integrated TB/HIV treatment support[29].

Respondents whose recent CD4 count less than 500 cell/mm³ were 70% less likely adhere to treatment compared to respondent whose CD4 count greater than 500 cell/mm³ [AOR=0.3,95%CI,(0.14-0.73]. Consistently high levels of adherence were an important determinant of virologic and immunologic outcomes. Study shows that CD4 cell count was increased by 179, 159, and 53 cells/mm³ among the groups with 100%, 80%–99%, and 0%–79% adherence level respectively [30]. A review conducted in a developing country found that the likelihood of the treatment failure was almost 5 times higher among patients with CD4 < 200 cells/mm³ compared to those with CD4 ≥ 200 cells/mm³[31]. As CD4 cell count increases, viral replication decreases, which means it has an inverse relationship with viral load. As patients' immune status drops, and the rate of viral load increases compared to the immune-competent individuals with HIV infection. In addition, users with compromised immunity are more susceptible to different opportunistic infections that endure the cruel cycle of immunity depletion and viral replication [32].

Patients who had been on WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterparts. It has been proven that HAART is effective in suppressing human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) replication, decreasing morbidity

and mortality associated with HIV, suppressing development and spread of ART drug-resistant HIV, and improving quality of life in adults as well as children infected with HIV. However, drugs don't work in patients who don't take them properly so that optimum adherence to HAART is critical to the successful outcome of patients receiving therapy [7, 8].

Poor adherence has several effects on patient health. Some of them severely compromise the effectiveness of treatment; make this a critical issue in population health from the perspective of quality of health and health economics. So there should be intervention aimed at improving adherence because it has a significant positive return on investment through primary prevention and control of adverse health outcomes [33].

Our measurement of adherence is based on PLHIV self-reports of missed doses which may be subject to social desirability and recall biases. This observational cross sectional study was limited to participants at south Gondar zone selected hospital and it include PLHIV who have been treated as out-patients so it exclude patients treated at in-patient level. Therefore, the results might not be generalizable. Using health belief model further exploration is important to identify possible trigger that enforcing adherence behavior. The health belief model helps to have deep insight on the consequences of non-adherence to ART, the personal risk of problems with regard to ART medication non-adherence, the value of adhering to ART, and the obstacles for not to taking their ART medication.

CONCLUSIONS

Stigma or discrimination, missing schedule clinical visits, being in anti-TB treatment, recent CD4 cells count less than 500 cell/mm³, and patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were factors associated with adherence to ART drugs. The establishment of a

monitoring and evaluation system during clinical visits helps to achieve optimal adherence. Maintaining relatively high CD4 cell counts during HAART encourages patients on ART to have optimal adherence, again this reduces disease severity. The intervention targeted to reduce discrimination, counseling before initiation of treatment, and educational therapy during follow-up is advised to have maximum effect on improving ART adherence.

ABBREVIATIONS

- 313 AACTG: Adult AIDS Clinical Trial Groups; AIDS: Acquired immune deficiency syndrome;
- 314 ART: Antiretro Viral therapy; ARV: Antiretroviral;; CD4: Cluster differentiation; CPCRA:
- 315 Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS, HIV: human immunodeficiency; HAART:
- 316 highly active antiretroviral therapy UNAIDS: United Nation Acquired Immune Deficiency
- 317 Syndrome WHO: world health organization.

Ethics approval and consent to participate

An ethical approval letter was obtained from the institutional review board of Wollo university college of medicine and health Sciences (no: 0156/CMHS/IRB/2020). Official Permission letter was obtained from the south Gondar zone Health Department and each hospital. The objective of the study was explained to all study subjects to obtain their verbal or written consent before the interview. Participants were informed that they had the full right to discontinue participating in the study if they felt discomfort. They were also assured that all the data provided by them would be kept confidential. In addition, no personal identifiers were used.

Consent for publication

327 Not required.

- 329 The full data set and other materials of this study can be obtained from the corresponding author
- 330 on reasonable request.

331 Funding

- 332 This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or
- 333 not-for-profit sectors.

Competing interests

All authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Acknowledgments

- 337 We would like to thank the south Gondar zone HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Office. We are
- 338 also grateful to the data collectors and professionals working in the ART clinic for facilitating the
- 339 data collection.

Contributors

- 341 SB conceives the research project, develops the proposal, supervised the data collection process,
- 342 conducts the analysis, and wrote the manuscript. TM develops the proposal, supervised data
- 343 collection, was involved in data analysis, and wrote the manuscript. Both authors read and
- 344 approved the final manuscript.

347 REFERENCES

- 348 1. Global HIV/AIDS statistics-fact sheet. UNAIDS, 2020
- 349 2. Ramos, Jr., Alberto, NM., Luiza H., Norman H. AIDS in Brazilian children: history,
- surveillance, antiretroviral therapy, and epidemiologic transition, 1984–2008. AIDS patient care
- and STDs, 2011. 25(4): p. 245-255.
- 352 3. Wubshet, M., Berhane, Y., Worku, A., Kebede, Y., Diro, E. High loss to follow-up and early
- mortality create a substantial reduction in patient retention in antiretroviral treatment programs
- in northwest Ethiopia. Isrn aids, 2012. 2012.
- 355 4. UNAIDS and World Health Organization, Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic update and health
- sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011. Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic
- update and health sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011.
- 5. Paterson, DL., Swindells, S., Mohr, J., Brester, M., Vergis, EN, Squier, C., et al., Adherence to
- protease inhibitor therapy and outcomes in patients with HIV infection. Annals of internal
- 360 medicine, 2000. 133(1): p. 21-30.
- 361 6. Deleuze, J., Sicard, D., Coste, J., Guerin. Enquête sur l'observance des traitements
- antirétroviraux comportant un inhibiteur de protéase chez les patients infectés par le VIH. in
- Annales de médecine interne (Paris). 2000.
- 364 7. Guidelines for pediatric HIV/AIDS care and treatment in Ethiopia. HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control
- 365 Office Addis Ababa,2008
- 366 8. Shah, CA. Adherence to high activity antiretroviral therapy (HAART) in pediatric patients infected
- with HIV: issues and interventions. The Indian Journal of Pediatrics, 2007. 74(1): p. 55.
- 368 9. Esteban, MG., Rodríguez, MJ., Vicario Z., Herreros DA. Influence of antiretroviral therapy
- characteristics on pediatric patient adherence. Farmacia hospitalaria: organo oficial de

- expresion cientifica de la Sociedad Espanola de Farmacia Hospitalaria, 2004. 28(6 Suppl 1): p.
- 371 34-39.
- 372 10. Malee, K., Williams, P., Montepiedra, G., McCabe, M., Nichols, S., Sirois, PA., et al.,
- 373 Medication adherence in children and adolescents with HIV infection: associations with
- behavioral impairment. AIDS patient care and STDs, 2011. 25(3): p. 191-200.
- 375 11. World Health Organization. The HIV drug resistance report(2012), Geneva; Switzerland.
- 12. Chesney, MA., Ickovics, JR., Chambers, DB., Gifford, AL., Neidig, J., Zwickl, B., et al., Self-
- reported adherence to antiretroviral medications among participants in HIV clinical trials: the
- AACTG adherence instruments. AIDS care, 2000. 12(3): p. 255-266.
- 379 13. Nyogea, D., et al., Determinants of antiretroviral adherence among HIV positive children and teenagers
- in rural Tanzania: a mixed-methods study. BMC infectious diseases, 2015. 15(1): p. 28.
- 381 14. Nachega, JB., Mtenga, S., Henning, L., Franzeck, FC., Glass, TR., Letang, E. et al., Adherence
- to antiretroviral therapy in HIV-infected adults in Soweto, South Africa. AIDS Research &
- 383 Human Retroviruses, 2004. 20(10): p. 1053-1056.
- 384 15. Mengistu, Z., and Chere, A. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and its associated factors among
- people living with HIV/AIDS in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian medical journal, 2012. 50(4): p.
- 386 355-361.
- 387 16. Vitoria, MS., Vella,S., and Ford,N. Scaling up antiretroviral therapy in resource-limited settings:
- adapting guidance to meet the challenges. Current Opinion in HIV and AIDS, 2013. 8(1): p. 12-18.
- 389 17. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Buchan, I., Orbinski, J., Attaran, A., Singh, S., et al., Adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy in Sub-Saharan Africa and North America. A Meta-analysis. JAMA,
- 391 2006. 296(6): p. 679-690.
- 392 18. 90-90-90 An ambitious treatment target to help end the AIDS epidemic, 2017.

- 19. Mannheimer, S., Friedland, G., Matts, J., Child, C., Chesney, M. The consistency of adherence
- 394 to antiretroviral therapy predicts biologic outcomes for Human Immunodeficiency Virus-
- infected persons in clinical trials. Clinical infectious diseases, 2002. 34(8): p. 1115-1121.
- 396 20. Letta, S., Demissie, A., Oljira, L., and Dessie, Y. Factors associated with adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) among adult people living with HIV and attending their clinical
- care, Eastern Ethiopia. BMC International health and human rights, 2015 15(1), pp.1-7.
- 399 21. Tadesse, S., Tadesse, A., Wubshet, M. adherence to antiretroviral treatment and associated factors
- among people living with HIV/AIDS in Northwest Ethiopia. J trop dis. 2014;**2**(133):2
- 401 22. Tiyou, A, Belachew, T., Alemseged, F., Biadgilign, S. Predictors of adherence to antiretroviral
- therapy among people living with HIV/AIDS in a resource-limited setting of southwest
- Ethiopia. AIDS research and therapy. 2010 Dec; 7(1):1-0.
- 404 23. Ketema, AK., and Weret, ZS. Assessment of adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy
- and associated factors among people living with HIV at Debre brihan Referral Hospital and
- Health Center, Northeast Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ).
- 407 2015;7:75.

- 408 24. Legesse., TA., and Reta MA. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and associated factors among
- people living with HIV/AIDS in Hara town and its surroundings, North-Eastern Ethiopia: a
- cross-sectional study. Ethiopian Journal of health sciences. 2019;29(3).
- 411 25. Awel, M. Antiretroviral adherence, and its detriments among people living with HIV/AIDS on highly
- active antiretroviral therapy in two hospitals of ormoyia regional state. Ethiopia. Ethiopian Public
- Health Association (EPHA) extract from EPHA—sponsored Master Thesis on HIV/AIDS extraction,
- 414 2008. 4: p. 9-19.
- 415 26. Maman, S., Abler, L., Parker, L., Lane, T., Chirowodza, A., Ntogwisangu, J., t al., A
- comparison of HIV stigma and discrimination in five international sites: The influence of care

- and treatment resources in high prevalence settings. Social Science & Medicine, 2009. 68(12):
- 418 p. 2271-2278.
- 419 27. Katz IT, Ryu AE, Onuegbu AG, Psaros C, Weiser SD, Bangsberg DR, Tsai AC. Impact of
- 420 HIV-related stigma on treatment adherence: systematic review and meta-synthesis. Journal of
- the International AIDS Society. 2013 Nov;16:18640.
- 422 28. Monjok, E., Smesny, A., Okokon, IB., Mgbere, O., Essien, EJ. Adherence to antiretroviral
- therapy in Nigeria: an overview of research studies and implications for policy and practice.
- 424 HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ), 2010. 2: p. 69.
- 425 29. Zinski, A., Westfall, AO., Gardner, LI., Giordano, TP., Wilson, TE., Drainoni, ML., et al. The
- contribution of missed clinic visits to disparities in HIV viral load outcomes. American journal
- of public health. 2015 Oct;105(10):2068-75.
- 428 30. Hogg, RS., Heath, K., Bangsberg, D., Yip, B., Press, N., O'Shaughnessy., et al., Intermittent
- use of triple-combination therapy is predictive of mortality at baseline and after 1 year of
- 430 follow-up. Aids, 2002. 16(7): p. 1051-1058.
- 431 31. Lailulo, Y., Kitenge, M., Jaffer, S., Aluko, O., Nyasulu, PS. Factors associated with
- antiretroviral treatment failure among people living with HIV on antiretroviral therapy in
- resource-poor settings: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Systematic Reviews. 2020
- 434 Dec;9(1):1-7.
- 435 32. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Bangsberg, DR., Singh, S., Rachlis, B., Wu, P., et al., Adherence to
- HAART: a systematic review of developed and developing nation patient-reported barriers and
- facilitators. PLoS medicine, 2006. 3(11).
- 438 33. UNAIDS. AIDS by the numbers 2015. Geneva Switzerland, 2015.

Table 1: demographic and economic characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020 to January 31 2021 (n = 432)

variables		Frequency(n=432)	Percentage (%)
sex			
	male	172	39.8
	female	260	60.2
Place of residence			
	urban	335	77.5
	rural	97	22.5
age			
	18-24	103	23.8
	25-34	217	50.2
	35-45	70	16.3
	>45	42	9.7
Monthly income			
	<1000	79	18.3
	≥1000	353	81.7
Educational status			
	Primary level of education	55	12.7
	Secondary level of education	314	72.7
	College and above	63	14.6

Table 2: family and clinical related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021 (n = 432)

variables		Frequency(n=432)	Percentage (%)
sex			
	male	172	39.8
	female	260	60.2
Place of residence			
	urban	335	77.5
	rural	97	22.5
age			
	18-24	103	23.8
	25-34	217	50.2
	35-45	70	16.3
	>45	42	9.7
Monthly income			
	<1000	79	18.3
	≥1000	353	81.7
Educational status			
	Primary level of education	55	12.7
	Secondary level of education	314	72.7
	College and above	63	14.6
•	nd clinical related characteristics ast 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021 (n =	= 432)	
		Frequency	(n=432 Percentage
variables			\ (0.45
variables) (%)
variables	_	226	52.3
	negative	17	52.3 3.9
variables			52.3

Yes		80	18.5
No Vos		352	81.5
Do you miss your dose in the last 7da	nys	252	01.5
Variables		Frequencies(n=432)	Percentage (%)
Table 3: Adherence and health care and south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020		21 (n = 432)	· ·
	>500cells/mm ³	341	78.9
Recent CD4 count	\leq 500cells/mm ³	87	20.1
	Stage-III	30	6.9
	Stage-II	352	81.5
WHO clinical disease stage during initiation of ART	Stage-I	50	11.6
	tdf +3tc +efv	259	60.0
	azt +3tc +nvp	30	6.9
	azt + 3tc + efv	143	33.1
treatment regimens	tdf +3tc +efv	259	60.0
	>500cells/mm ³	336	86.8
Baseline CD4 count	\leq 500cells/mm ³	51	13.2
	Yes	392	90.7
Do you use reminder	No	40	9.3
	Yes	81	18.8
medicine			
Do you use complementary	No	351	81.3
	yes	45	10.4
Stigma and discrimination	no	387	89.6
	friend	3	0.8
	Sexual partner	173	68.2
To whom Serostatus disclosed	family	79	31

Table 3: Adherence and health care service-related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021 (n = 432)

Variables		Frequencies(n=	=432) Percentage (%)
Do you miss your	dose in the last 7days		
	No	352	81.5
	Yes	80	18.5
No of missed doses	S		

	1-2 doses	57	13.2
	3-4 doses	23	5.3
Reason for missing to tal	ke ART medication		
	Away from home	19	23.75
	forgot	31	38.75
	Busy with other things	12	15
	sickness	18	22.5
Missed scheduled clinica	l visit		
	No	386	89.4
	Yes	46	10.6
Do you take Drugs other	than ARV		
	No	328	75.9
	Yes	104	24.1

Table 4: Factors associated with ART adherence among adult patients on ART in public health institutions in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021.

	no 275 yes 77	gust 1, 2020, t		21.	p- value
health institutions in	Adher adhere no 275	rence to ARV ont Non- adherent	O January 31, 20 COR(95%CI)	AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	south Gondar zone, Au Adher	rence to ARV ont Non-adherent	o January 31, 20	AOR(95%CI)	р-
health institutions in	south Gondar zone, Au Adher	rence to ARV	o January 31, 20	21.	р-
	south Gondar zone, Au Adher	rence to ARV	o January 31, 20	21.	р-
	south Gondar zone, Au	gust 1, 2020, t	o January 31, 20	21.	р-
	south Gondar zone, Au	gust 1, 2020, t	o January 31, 20	21.	
	Yes	,	104	24.1	
	No		328	75.9	
Do you take Drugs ot					
	Yes		46	10.6	
	No		386	89.4	
Missed scheduled clir	nical visit				
	sickness		18	22.5	
	Busy with other th	nings	12	15	
	forgot		31	38.75	
	Away from home		19	23.75	
Reason for missing to	take ART medication				
	3-4 doses		23	5.3	

WHO clinical sta	<500 cells/mm ³ age three at the time	27 e of ART	17 initiation	0.23(0.12-0.56)	0.3(0.14-0.73)	0.007
	Stage-I	42	8	1		
	Stage-II	291	61	0.208(0.68-0.633))	
	Stage-III	12	11	0.23(0.1-0.55)	0.24(0.098-0.57)	0.027

STROBE Statement—checklist of items that should be included in reports of observational studies

		Item No	Recommendation	Line no
Title and absti	ract	1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the title or the	1-3
			abstract	
			(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary of what	23-65
			was done and what was found	
Introduction				
Background/rat	tionale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported	66-120
Objectives		3	State specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses	121-122
Methods				
Study design	4	Present key elem	nents of study design early in the paper	135
Setting	5	Describe the sett follow-up, and d	ing, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment, exposure, ata collection	136-140
Participants	6	•	—Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection of	
		-	cribe methods of follow-up	
			dy—Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of case	
			d control selection. Give the rationale for the choice of cases and controls	
			study—Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of selection	
		of participants		141-155
			—For matched studies, give matching criteria and number of exposed and	
		unexposed		
			dy—For matched studies, give matching criteria and the number of controls	
Variables	7	Clearly define al	l outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect	157-162
v arrables	7	-	diagnostic criteria, if applicable	137-102
Data	8*		le of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of assessment	164-175
sources/	O		Describe comparability of assessment methods if there is more than one	107173
measurement		group	or account monday is more than one	
Bias	9	<u> </u>	orts to address potential sources of bias	176-184
Study size	10		study size was arrived at	186-191
Quantitative	11		antitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable, describe which	192-193
variables		groupings were		
Statistical	12	(a) Describe all s	statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	
methods		(b) Describe any	methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	
		(c) Explain how	missing data were addressed	
		- · · ·	—If applicable, explain how loss to follow-up was addressed	
			- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
		Case-control stu	dy—If applicable, explain how matching of cases and controls was addressed	
			dy—If applicable, explain how matching of cases and controls was addressed study—If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of sampling	

 (\underline{e}) Describe any sensitivity analyses

Continued on next page

Results Participants	13*	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible,	
•		examined for eligibility, confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	207-
		anarysea	208
		(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	
		(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	
Descriptive	14*	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information	208-
data		on exposures and potential confounders	219
		(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	
		(c) Cohort study—Summarise follow-up time (eg, average and total amount)	
Outcome data	15*	Cohort study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures over time	
		Case-control study—Report numbers in each exposure category, or summary measures of exposure	
		Cross-sectional study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	222-
			228
Main results	16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision	
		(eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were	220
		included	229- 238
		(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	
		(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful	
		time period	
Other analyses	17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses	
Discussion			
Key results	18	Summarise key results with reference to study objectives	244-
			295
Limitations	19	Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision.	296-
		Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias	304
Interpretation	20	Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity of	306-
		analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence	309
Generalisability	21	Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results	310-
•			313
Other informati	on		
Funding	22	Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable, for the	334-
		original study on which the present article is based	355

^{*}Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

Note: An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.

BMJ Open

Magnitude of optimal adherence and predictors for a low level of adherence among HIV/AIDS infected adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia: A multi-facility cross-sectional study

Journal:	BMJ Open
Manuscript ID	bmjopen-2021-056009.R2
Article Type:	Original research
Date Submitted by the Author:	23-Nov-2021
Complete List of Authors:	Zewude, Shimeles; Debre Tabor University, Ajebe, Tewodros ; Wollo University
Primary Subject Heading :	HIV/AIDS
Secondary Subject Heading:	Global health, Infectious diseases, Nursing, Public health, Sexual health
Keywords:	HIV & AIDS < INFECTIOUS DISEASES, PUBLIC HEALTH, Adverse events < THERAPEUTICS, Quality in health care < HEALTH SERVICES ADMINISTRATION & MANAGEMENT

SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts



I, the Submitting Author has the right to grant and does grant on behalf of all authors of the Work (as defined in the below author licence), an exclusive licence and/or a non-exclusive licence for contributions from authors who are: i) UK Crown employees; ii) where BMJ has agreed a CC-BY licence shall apply, and/or iii) in accordance with the terms applicable for US Federal Government officers or employees acting as part of their official duties; on a worldwide, perpetual, irrevocable, royalty-free basis to BMJ Publishing Group Ltd ("BMJ") its licensees and where the relevant Journal is co-owned by BMJ to the co-owners of the Journal, to publish the Work in this journal and any other BMJ products and to exploit all rights, as set out in our licence.

The Submitting Author accepts and understands that any supply made under these terms is made by BMJ to the Submitting Author unless you are acting as an employee on behalf of your employer or a postgraduate student of an affiliated institution which is paying any applicable article publishing charge ("APC") for Open Access articles. Where the Submitting Author wishes to make the Work available on an Open Access basis (and intends to pay the relevant APC), the terms of reuse of such Open Access shall be governed by a Creative Commons licence – details of these licences and which Creative Commons licence will apply to this Work are set out in our licence referred to above.

Other than as permitted in any relevant BMJ Author's Self Archiving Policies, I confirm this Work has not been accepted for publication elsewhere, is not being considered for publication elsewhere and does not duplicate material already published. I confirm all authors consent to publication of this Work and authorise the granting of this licence.

1	Magnitude of optimal adherence and predictors for a low level of adherence among
2	HIV/AIDS infected adults in south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia: A multi-facility
3	cross-sectional study
4	Shimeles Biru Zewude (SB) ^{1*} Tewodros Magegnet Ajebe (TM) ²
5	¹ Department of Midwifery, College of Health Sciences, Debre Tabor University, Debre Tabor,
6	Ethiopia
7	² Department of Midwifery, College Of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, Dessie,
8	Ethiopia
9	1*Corresponding Authors: - Shimeles Biru Zewude
10	Shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
11	
12	SB: shimeles.biru@yahoo.com
13	TM: Ajebeteddy@gmail.com
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

- 23 Abstract
- Objectives: This study aims to identify levels of adherence to ART drugs and factors associated
- 25 with them in northwest Ethiopia. We hypothesize that in the era of covid -19 there would be
- suboptimal adherence to ART drugs.
- **Design:** An observational cross-sectional study was conducted. Factors associated with the level
- of adherence were selected for multiple logistic regressions at a p-value of less than 0.2 in the
- analysis. Statistically significant associated factors were identified at a p-value less than 0.05 and
- adjusted OR (AOR) with a 95% CI.
- 31 Setting: the study was conducted in one specialized hospital and three district hospitals found in
- 32 the south Gondar zone, Northwest Ethiopia.
- Participants: About 432 people living with HIV/AIDS receiving HAART in South Gondar zone
- 34 public hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than three months period participated in
- 35 the study.
- 36 Primary and secondary outcome measures: levels of adherence to ART drugs and their associated
- 37 factors.
- **Results:** among 432 study participants 81.5% (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants had optimally
- 39 adherent to ART drugs. Determinants of a low level of adherence; Stigma or discrimination (OR,
- 40 0.4, p=0.016), missed scheduled clinical visit (OR, 0.45 p=0.034), being on TB treatment (OR,
- 41 0.45 p=0.01], recent CD4 cells count less than 500 cell/mm³ (OR, 0.3 p=0.023) and patients who
- 42 had been a WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation (OR, 0.24 p=0.027) were
- 43 factors significantly associated with adherence to ART drugs.

44	Conclusions: level of adherence was relatively low compared with some local studies. The
45	intervention targeted to reduce discrimination, counseling before initiation of treatment, and
46	awareness regarding compliance is advised to improve adherence to antiretroviral regimens.

Strength and Limitations of the study

- There is a possibility of recall bias and social desirability bias.
- Findings are also generalizable only for patients treated as out-patients.
- Being a cross-sectional survey, causality cannot be inferred from those findings.
 - Adherence level is a snapshot of adherence behavior during covid-19 infection.
- The present study has strength due to the use of robust data collection tools that ensured the quality of the study.

INTRODUCTION

- 66 HIV/AIDS is one of the pandemic public health problems still affecting many people. At the end
- of 2020, globally 37.7 million people globally were living with HIV. In the same year, 1.5 million
- 68 people were newly infected by the virus and 680000 people died from AIDS-related illnesses [1].
- 69 Countries are taking different actions to tackle the HIV/AIDS virus epidemic as well as to improve
- 70 the quality of life among people infected by the virus; one of these was the treatment of the patient
- 71 with ART therapy [2].
- 72 In Ethiopia, achieving optimal adherence and sustainable follow up in care and treatment are the
- 73 most difficulties in HIV/AIDS management. A five-year retrospective medical record review of
- 74 3012 adult patients who were enrolled in therapy at Gondar University Hospital ART clinic
- 75 demonstrated that 31.4% of patients had been lost to follow-up [3].
- 76 Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART) involves sophisticated regimens that necessitate
- 77 careful adherence to intricate treatment schedules owning to the high risk of developing treatment-
- 78 resistant forms of HIV as a result of missing, underdosing, and irregular use of antiretroviral
- 79 drugs[4].
- 80 Adherence to multi-drug antiretroviral regimens has been a focus of attention since ART drugs
- 81 introduction owning to their complexity, frequent adverse effects, and chronic nature [5,6].
- 82 To get optimal viral suppression and prevent treatment failure individual should take more than
- 83 95% of prescribed drugs. If once the individual fails to take more than 95% of prescribed drugs
- 84 virologic failure rate will be more than 50% [7,8].
- 85 Antiretroviral medication noncompliance can result in negative clinical, immunological, and
- 86 virological effects. In the absence of good adherence, the immune system continues to be
- 87 distracted, resulting in lower CD4 cell levels and the establishment of resistant virus strains [9,10].

- 88 According to a World Health Organization (WHO) survey study in developing countries, the
- 89 HIV/AIDS drug resistance rate among people starting ART ranged from 4.8% in 2007 to 6.8% in
- 90 2010[11].

- 91 A considerable number of ART patients struggle to maintain a high level of adherence. According
- 92 to previous studies, 12 to 50 percent of HIV-positive patients do not attain adequate adherence
- 93 [12]. A study conducted in rural Tanzania showed that 70% of the participants achieved the
- 94 desired level of adherence [13]. In Soweto, South Africa 88% of patients report more than 95%
- 95 adherence rate, and the main reasons given for missing doses were being away from home (30%),
- 96 difficulty with the daily routine (23%), and running out of pills (12%)[14].
- 97 A study done in Addis Ababa city describes that among patients on ART drugs, 73.3% of
- 98 participants had an optimal level of adherence. Stigma, discrimination, and poor relationship with
- 99 health care providers were predictors for a suboptimal level of adherence [15].
- 100 Social and economic difficulties, the health-care policies, disease traits, disease therapies, and
- 101 patient-related factors are all potential impediments to patients complying with treatment
- 102 plans[16].
- 103 Fear of disclosure, concurrent substance abuse, forgetfulness, suspicions of treatment, overly
- 104 complicated regimens, number of pills required, decreased quality of life, work and family
- 105 responsibilities, falling asleep, and access to medication were all identified as obstacles to
- adherence in a systematic review study[17].
- 107 Now on countries devised a comprehensive plan to address HIV/AIDS prevention and care. This
- is in line with the three 90's target set by UNAIDS to help end the AIDS epidemic by 2030[18].
- 109 The target states that 90% of all people receiving ART will have viral suppression. The plan and
- 110 strategic objectives are fruitless if adherence to HAART is not well recognized.

Currently, our world including Ethiopia has been struggling to prevent and control a new
pandemic disease called SARS-COV-2 however, chronic diseases like HIV/AIDS were put aside
especially in developing countries. We hypothesize that there may be suboptimal adherence to
ART drugs among people living with HIV. Having a strategy to sustain an optimal level of
adherence among people living with HIV is an essential step towards ensuring treatment success.
The knowledge would help to evaluate the clinical management strategies and define relevant,
efficient, acceptable adherence support measures for patients within the health system. So the
main purpose of this study was to determine the level of adherence and its predictors among
people living with HIV who have been using HAART.
Therefore, this observational study hypothesizes that in the era of covid -19 there would be

suboptimal adherence to ART drugs among people living with HIV/AIDS.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

135 Study setting, design, and periods

A multicenter facility-based observational cross-sectional study was conducted from August to January 2021 in the south Gondar zone, Amhara region. South Gondar zone is divided into 19 woredas and structured with one general hospital, seven primary hospitals. All of them are providing ART care and treatment for its consumer. In the zone, there is 6870 HIV/AIDS infected patient enrolled in ART care and treatment. In this study, four public hospitals were selected randomly which provide ART care and treatment for HIV/AIDS infected people.

Population

people living with HIV/AIDS (≥18 years old) receiving HAART in South Gondar zone public hospitals were the study populations and the study participants were adult people living with HIV/AIDS (≥18 years old) treated as out-patients in selected public hospitals and who have been on treatment for more than three month period.

Eligibility criteria

HIV/AIDS infected people greater than or equal to eighteen years of age, PLHIV who have been on treatment for more than three months period and continuing their ART during the study period were eligible for this study.

Sampling technique and procedure

The study was conducted in four randomly selected hospitals. Then the possible number of participants in each of the hospitals of the study area was allocated proportionally based on their order of arrival. Using the eligibility criteria each study participant was included in the study and a systematic random sampling technique (every 5th interval) was applied based on their order of arrival in the ART clinics.

Explanatory variables

Socio-demographic (age, educational status, residence, marital status), personal and family-related (disclosure of serostatus, stigma, and discrimination, use of complementary medicine), medication-related (drug other than ARV, patients on ART, missed scheduled clinical visit), clinical (Patients on TB treatment), immunological factors (Recent CD4 count, WHO clinical stage) were factors included in the regression analysis.

Data collection instruments

The data collection tool was adapted from two main sources. Questionnaire from AIDS Clinical Trial Groups (AACTG) [12] adherence instrument which measured level of adherence based on patients self-report. A questionnaire from the Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS (CPCRA) [19] was used to collect other information including the clinical aspect of the patient. Taking all antiretroviral treatment at a right time in the week before the study was a cutoff value to consider optimal adherence to the ART medication. Otherwise, it is categorized as non-adherent. If they report missed doses during the last seven days, the questionnaire asks a range of multiple-choice questions about why they miss their daily dose. Patients' clinical data such as WHO clinical stage and the CD4 counts were extracted from their medical records at the ART clinic by using a checklist which was adapted from different literature. Data collection was performed by five-diploma nurses (supervised by three BSC nurses). A two days comprehensive training was given for data collectors and supervisors. The questionnaire was compiled in English and evaluated by experts who had expertise in AIDS care and treatment situations in our country. Five AIDS experts were invited to review the Amharic version (local language) of the questionnaire for face validity and readability. The questionnaire had pilot tested on 30(5% of the sample) HIV-infected people. It was reported

reliable and valid with 0.83α -Cronbach, shows high level of internal consistency, 85% general inter-observer agreement, 78% sensitivity, and 95% specificity, so it had been appropriate and easy to understand by participants. Data collectors were trained to have a common understanding of the objective and the methodology of the research. The investigators were closely supervised the performance of the data collectors daily.

Operational definitions

- Good (optimal) Adherence: when taking all antiretroviral treatment in a correctly prescribed dose in the one week before the study [20].
 - Sample size calculation
- The sample size in this cross-sectional study was determined using a single proportion formula n= $(Za/2)^2pq/d^2$. The minimum sample size required for the study was estimated to be 432 using the above formula where n is the sample size, z is the standard normal deviate set at 1.96 (for 95% confidence level), d margin of error acceptable or measure of precision (taken as 0.035) and p=85.3% taken from the previous study [21] and sample size adjusted by 10% non-response.

Statistical analysis

Data entry and analysis were done by using Epi info V.7.1 and SPSS V.23 respectively. We have computed the Frequencies and percentages of different variables for description as appropriate. Using Chi-square test bivariate analysis of variables was competed with Odds ratio at 95% confidence interval to assess the presence and degree of association between the dependent and independent variables. We hypothesize that there would be suboptimal adherence to ART drugs among people living with HIV so a one-tailed p-value was applied. To control possible confounding variables explanatory variables associated with outcome variables with p<0.2 were

entered into multivariable logistic regression analysis. Statistically significant associated factors were identified based on a p-value<0.05.

Patient and public involvement (PPI)

206 Members of the public were not involved in the study concept or design.

207 RESULTS

Demographic and economic characteristics

A total of 432 HIV/AIDS infected patients who reported using ART were interviewed about adherence to their medication, giving a response rate of 100%. The population consists of one hundred seventy-two (39.8%) male and two hundred sixty female (60.2%) and 335(77.5%) were urban residents. Out of the total population, 217(50.2%) were in the age group between 25-34 years and the mean age of study participants was 30.6±8 years. The majority of participants 322(74.5%) were married. From the total population 211(48.8%) participants were government employees and the majority of patients' monthly income was more or equal to 1000 Ethiopian birr (table 1).

Family and clinical related characteristics

Out of the total population, 255(59%) patients disclose their serostatus. From the overall population, 45(10.4%) participants were stigmatized and/or discriminated by their family, friends, or community. Again 81(18.8%) were using traditional medicine in addition to their ART drugs. Regular mealtimes 193(44.7%) was the most common reminder (**Table 2**).

Adherence and health care service characteristics

Based on the patient's self-report 81.5 % (95% CI; 78-85.2) of participants had optimal adherence level (take their entire daily dose) one week before the interview. The reason given for missing their treatment was forgetting 31 (7.1%) and being away from home 19 (4.4%). Only 46(10.6%) of study participants miss the scheduled clinical visit and 104(24.1%) patients were taking drugs other than their ART medicine (**table 3**)

Factors associated with adherence to ART

Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to non-stigmatized and non-discriminated patients [AOR=0.4, 95%CI (0.2-0.84)]. Patients who missed scheduled clinical visits were 55% less likely to adhere to their ART treatment compared to patients who didn't miss scheduled clinical visits 55% [AOR=0.45(0.21-0.94)]. Patients who had been on TB treatment have been 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who had been no TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. Respondents whose recent CD4 cells count, less than 500 cells/mm³ were 70% less likely to adhere to treatment compared to respondents whose CD4 count was greater than 500 cells/ mm³ [AOR=0.3(0.14-0.73]. patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterpart [AOR=0.24(0.098-0.57)] (table 4).

5 DISCUSSION

This study was focused on the magnitude of optimal ART drug adherence and associated factors for a low level of adherence among HIV/AIDS infected patients at public hospitals in the south Gondar zone. The study found that 81.5 % of participants were having an optimal adherence based on a one-week recall before the actual interview. This is far less than the finding in southwest Ethiopia where 95% of patients had optimal adherence to their prescribed doses [22] and similarly, in northeast Ethiopia, 95% of patients also had optimal adherence to their medication [23]. However, our findings were comparably higher than those found in Tanzania, only 70% of the participants achieved the desired level of adherence [13]. Another study conducted in northeastern Ethiopia explains that the level of optimal adherence was found to be 71.8% in the past seven days of recall of their daily doses [24]. But it is almost consistent with a study finding in Addis Ababa reporting 82.8% of patients had optimal adherence [25]. Stigmatized or discriminated patients were 60% [AOR0.4, 75%CI (0.2-0.84) less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to their counterparts. Stigma and discrimination, especially in Sub-Saharan Africa play the main role for poor patient follow up in treatment care and extensive contribution for inadequate HIV/AIDS prevention [26]. Patients frequently skipped doses due to fear of being identified as HIV-positive. A systematic review of 26,715 HIV-positive people in 32 countries discovered that HIV-related stigma hampered adherence to antiretroviral therapy (ART), principally through impairing social support and adaptive measure taken to manage stigma during medication. The study highlights the relevance of social relationships in improving adherence, particularly in resource-constrained contexts, and highlights the importance of social integration in HIV-positive people treatment experiences [27].

Patients who had been on TB treatment have 55% less likely to adhere to ART treatment compared to patients who didn't have TB treatment [(AOR=0.45(0.24-0.83)]. A cross-sectional study found that individuals who had been on TB treatment in addition to ART drugs have a high level of ART non-adherence [28]. Patients were more frequently adhere to TB treatment compared to antiretroviral treatment. This might be due to the shorter duration of TB treatment compared to life-long ART medication. Another possible reason, patients prioritize TB treatment and would have less attention to life-long ART medication to avoid the burden of medications [29].

Respondents whose recent CD4 count less than 500 cell/mm³ were 70% less likely adhere to treatment compared to respondent whose CD4 count greater than 500 cell/mm³ [AOR=0.3,95%CI,(0.14-0.73)]. Study finding show that optimal level of adherence was found to be a key factor in virologic and immunologic results. A CD4 cell count was increased by 179, 159, and 53 cells/mm³ in the groups had 100%, 80 to 99 %, and 0% to 79 % level of adherence respectively [30]. A study conducted in a developing nation, patients with CD4 counts below 200 cells/mm³ had a nearly 5 times higher chance of treatment failure than those with CD4 counts above 200 cells/mm³[31]. Viral replication reduces when CD4 cell count rises, implying that viral burden is inversely proportional to CD4 cell count. When compared to immune-competent patients with HIV infection, patients with deteriorated immune status had raised viral load. Furthermore, individuals with weakened immunity are more vulnerable to a variety of opportunistic illnesses, which suffer from the vicious cycle of immune depletion and viral replication [32].

Patients who had been on WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were 76% less adherent to ART therapy compared to their counterparts. It has been proven that HAART is effective in suppressing human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) replication, decreasing morbidity

and mortality associated with HIV, suppressing development and spread of ART drug-resistant HIV, and improving quality of life in adults as well as children infected with HIV. However, drugs don't work in patients who don't take them properly so optimal adherence to HAART is a crucial step towards the successful outcome of therapy [7, 8].

Poor adherence has several effects on patient health. Some of them severely compromise the effectiveness of treatment; making this a critical issue in the population health from the perspective of quality of health and health economics. So there should be an intervention aimed at improving adherence because it has a significant positive return on patient's health through primary prevention and control of adverse outcomes [33].

Using the health belief model further exploration is important to identify the possible trigger that enforces adherence behavior. The health belief model helps to have deep insight on the consequences of non-adherence to ART, the personal risk of problems about medication non-adherence, the value of adhering to ART drugs, and the obstacles for not taking ART medication.

The limitations of this study were, measurement of adherence is based on PLHIV self-reports of missed doses which may be subject to social desirability and recall biases. Findings are also generalizable only for patients treated as out-patients; it excludes patients treated at the in-patient level. This condition may limit to conclude in-patient treated people living with HIV/AIDS. Since the study was conducted during the covid-19 pandemic disease, the actual magnitude of optimal adherence may not be similar to our finding. As this is a cross-sectional study, cause-effect relation could not be analyzed. Despite these limitations, our study demonstrates strengths. One of the strengths, it was conducted using two standardized sounded adherence measurement tools which helped in ensuring the quality of the studies.

CONCLUSIONS

Stigma or discrimination, missing scheduled clinical visits, being in anti-TB treatment, recent CD4 cells count less than 500 cells/mm³, and patients in WHO clinical stage three at the time of ART initiation were factors associated with a low level of adherence to ART drugs. The establishment of a monitoring and evaluation system during clinical visits helps to achieve optimal adherence. Maintaining relatively high CD4 cell counts during HAART encourages patients on ART to have optimal adherence, again this reduces disease severity. The intervention targeted to reduce discrimination, counseling before initiation of treatment, and educational therapy during follow-up is advised to have maximum effect on improving ART adherence.

ABBREVIATIONS

- 322 AACTG: Adult AIDS Clinical Trial Groups; AIDS: Acquired immune deficiency syndrome;
- 323 ART: Antiretro Viral therapy; ARV: Antiretroviral; CD4: Cluster differentiation; CPCRA:
- 324 Community Programs for Clinical Research on AIDS, HIV: human immunodeficiency; HAART:
- 325 highly active antiretroviral therapy UNAIDS: United Nation Acquired Immune Deficiency
- 326 Syndrome WHO: world health organization.

7 Ethics approval and consent to participate

- An ethical approval letter was obtained from the institutional review board of Wollo university college of medicine and health Sciences (no: 0156/CMHS/IRB/2020). Official Permission letter was obtained from the south Gondar zone Health Department and each hospital. The objective of
- 330 was obtained from the south Gondar zone Health Department and each hospital. The objective of
- 331 the study was explained to all study subjects to obtain their verbal or written consent before the
- interview. Participants were informed that they had the full right to discontinue participating in the

- 33 study if they felt discomfort. They were also assured that all the data provided by them would be
- 334 kept confidential. In addition, no personal identifiers were used.

Consent for publication

336 Not required.

Availability of data and materials

- 338 The full data set and other materials of this study can be obtained from the corresponding author
- 339 on reasonable request.

340 Funding

- 341 This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or
- 342 not-for-profit sectors.

43 Competing interests

All authors declare that they have no competing interests.

5 Acknowledgments

- 346 We would like to express our gratitude to south Gondar zone HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control
- 347 Office. We are also grateful to the data collectors and professionals working in the ART clinic for
- 348 facilitating the data collection.

Contributors

- 350 SB conceives the research project, develops the proposal, supervised the data collection process,
- 351 conducts the analysis, and wrote the manuscript. TM develops the proposal, supervised data

REFERENCES

- 355 1. Global HIV/AIDS statistics-fact sheet. UNAIDS, 2020
- 356 2. Ramos, Jr., Alberto, NM., Luiza H., Norman H. AIDS in Brazilian children: history,
- surveillance, antiretroviral therapy, and epidemiologic transition, 1984–2008. AIDS patient care
- and STDs, 2011. 25(4): p. 245-255.
- 359 3. Wubshet, M., Berhane, Y., Worku, A., Kebede, Y., Diro, E. High loss to follow-up and early
- mortality create a substantial reduction in patient retention in antiretroviral treatment programs
- in northwest Ethiopia. Isrn aids, 2012. 2012.
- 362 4. UNAIDS and World Health Organization, Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic update and health
- sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011. Global HIV/AIDS response: epidemic
- update and health sector progress towards universal access: progress report 2011.
- 365 5. Paterson, DL., Swindells, S., Mohr, J., Brester, M., Vergis, EN, Squier, C., et al., Adherence to
- protease inhibitor therapy and outcomes in patients with HIV infection. Annals of internal
- 367 medicine, 2000. 133(1): p. 21-30.
- 368 6. Deleuze, J., Sicard, D., Coste, J., Guerin. Enquête sur l'observance des traitements
- antirétroviraux comportant un inhibiteur de protéase chez les patients infectés par le VIH. in
- Annales de médecine interne (Paris). 2000.
- 371 7. Guidelines for pediatric HIV/AIDS care and treatment in Ethiopia. HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control
- 372 Office Addis Ababa,2008
- 373 8. Shah, CA. Adherence to high activity antiretroviral therapy (HAART) in pediatric patients infected
- with HIV: issues and interventions. The Indian Journal of Pediatrics, 2007. 74(1): p. 55.

- 375 9. Esteban, MG., Rodríguez, MJ., Vicario Z., Herreros DA. Influence of antiretroviral therapy
- 376 characteristics on pediatric patient adherence. Farmacia hospitalaria: organo oficial de
- expresion cientifica de la Sociedad Espanola de Farmacia Hospitalaria, 2004. 28(6 Suppl 1): p.
- 378 34-39.
- 379 10. Malee, K., Williams, P., Montepiedra, G., McCabe, M., Nichols, S., Sirois, PA., et al.,
- Medication adherence in children and adolescents with HIV infection: associations with
- behavioral impairment. AIDS patient care and STDs, 2011. 25(3): p. 191-200.
- 382 11. World Health Organization. The HIV drug resistance report(2012), Geneva; Switzerland.
- 383 12. Chesney, MA., Ickovics, JR., Chambers, DB., Gifford, AL., Neidig, J., Zwickl, B., et al., Self-
- reported adherence to antiretroviral medications among participants in HIV clinical trials: the
- AACTG adherence instruments. AIDS care, 2000. 12(3): p. 255-266.
- 386 13. Nyogea, D., et al., Determinants of antiretroviral adherence among HIV positive children and teenagers
- in rural Tanzania: a mixed-methods study. BMC infectious diseases, 2015. 15(1): p. 28.
- 388 14. Nachega, JB., Mtenga, S., Henning, L., Franzeck, FC., Glass, TR., Letang, E. et al., Adherence
- to antiretroviral therapy in HIV-infected adults in Soweto, South Africa. AIDS Research &
- 390 Human Retroviruses, 2004. 20(10): p. 1053-1056.
- 391 15. Mengistu, Z., and Chere, A. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and its associated factors among
- people living with HIV/AIDS in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Ethiopian medical journal, 2012. 50(4): p.
- 393 355-361.
- 394 16. Vitoria, MS., Vella,S., and Ford,N. Scaling up antiretroviral therapy in resource-limited settings:
- adapting guidance to meet the challenges. Current Opinion in HIV and AIDS, 2013. 8(1): p. 12-18.
- 396 17. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Buchan, I., Orbinski, J., Attaran, A., Singh, S., et al., Adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy in Sub-Saharan Africa and North America. A Meta-analysis. JAMA,
- 398 2006. 296(6): p. 679-690.

- 18. 90–90–90 An ambitious treatment target to help end the AIDS epidemic, 2017.
- 400 19. Mannheimer, S., Friedland, G., Matts, J., Child, C., Chesney, M. The consistency of adherence
- 401 to antiretroviral therapy predicts biologic outcomes for Human Immunodeficiency Virus-
- infected persons in clinical trials. Clinical infectious diseases, 2002. 34(8): p. 1115-1121.
- 403 20. Letta, S., Demissie, A., Oljira, L., and Dessie, Y. Factors associated with adherence to
- Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) among adult people living with HIV and attending their clinical
- care, Eastern Ethiopia. BMC International health and human rights, 2015 15(1), pp.1-7.
- 406 21. Tadesse, S., Tadesse, A., Wubshet, M. adherence to antiretroviral treatment and associated factors
- among people living with HIV/AIDS in Northwest Ethiopia. J Trop dis. 2014;**2**(133):2
- 408 22. Tiyou, A, Belachew, T., Alemseged, F., Biadgilign, S. Predictors of adherence to antiretroviral
- therapy among people living with HIV/AIDS in a resource-limited setting of southwest
- Ethiopia. AIDS research and therapy. 2010 Dec; 7(1):1-0.
- 411 23. Ketema, AK., and Weret, ZS. Assessment of adherence to highly active antiretroviral therapy
- and associated factors among people living with HIV at Debre Berhan Referral Hospital and
- Health Center, Northeast Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ).
- 414 2015;7:75.

- 415 24. Legesse., TA., and Reta MA. Adherence to antiretroviral therapy and associated factors among
- people living with HIV/AIDS in Hara town and its surroundings, North-Eastern Ethiopia: a
- cross-sectional study. Ethiopian Journal of health sciences. 2019;29(3).
- 418 25. Awel, M. Antiretroviral adherence, and its detriments among people living with HIV/AIDS on highly
- active antiretroviral therapy in two hospitals of Oromiya regional state. Ethiopia. Ethiopian Public
- Health Association (EPHA) extract from EPHA—sponsored Master Thesis on HIV/AIDS extract no,
- 421 2008. 4: p. 9-19.

- 422 26. Maman, S., Abler, L., Parker, L., Lane, T., Chirowodza, A., Ntogwisangu, J., t al., A
- comparison of HIV stigma and discrimination in five international sites: The influence of care
- and treatment resources in high prevalence settings. Social Science & Medicine, 2009. 68(12):
- 425 p. 2271-2278.
- 426 27. Katz IT, Ryu AE, Onuegbu AG, Psaros C, Weiser SD, Bangsberg DR, Tsai AC. Impact of
- 427 HIV-related stigma on treatment adherence: systematic review and meta-synthesis. Journal of
- the International AIDS Society. 2013 Nov;16:18640.
- 429 28. Monjok, E., Smesny, A., Okokon, IB., Mgbere, O., Essien, EJ. Adherence to antiretroviral
- therapy in Nigeria: an overview of research studies and implications for policy and practice.
- 431 HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ), 2010. 2: p. 69.
- 432 29. Zinski, A., Westfall, AO., Gardner, LI., Giordano, TP., Wilson, TE., Drainoni, ML., et al. The
- contribution of missed clinic visits to disparities in HIV viral load outcomes. American journal
- of public health. 2015 Oct;105(10):2068-75.
- 435 30. Hogg, RS., Heath, K., Bangsberg, D., Yip, B., Press, N., O'Shaughnessy., et al., Intermittent
- use of triple-combination therapy is predictive of mortality at baseline and after 1 year of
- 437 follow-up. Aids, 2002. 16(7): p. 1051-1058.
- 438 31. Lailulo, Y., Kitenge, M., Jaffer, S., Aluko, O., Nyasulu, PS. Factors associated with
- antiretroviral treatment failure among people living with HIV on antiretroviral therapy in
- resource-poor settings: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Systematic Reviews. 2020
- 441 Dec;9(1):1-7.
- 442 32. Mills, EJ., Nachega, JB., Bangsberg, DR., Singh, S., Rachlis, B., Wu, P., et al., Adherence to
- HAART: a systematic review of developed and developing nation patient-reported barriers and
- facilitators. PLoS medicine, 2006. 3(11).

Table 1: demographic and economic characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31 2021 (n = 432)

variables		Frequency(n=432)	Percentage (%)
sex			
	male	172	39.8
	female	260	60.2
Place of residence			
	urban	335	77.5
	rural	97	22.5
age			
	18-24	103	23.8
	25-34	217	50.2
	35-45	70	16.3
	>45	42	9.7
Monthly income			
	<1000	79	18.3
	≥1000	353	81.7
Educational status			
	Primary level of education	55	12.
	Secondary level of education	314	72.7
	College and above	63	14.6

Table 2: family and clinical related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021 (n = 432)

variables		Frequency(n=432)	Percentage (%)
Serostatus of sexual partner	positive	226	52.3
	negative	17	3.9
	unknown	189	43.7
disclosure status	Not-disclosed	177	41
	disclosed	255	59
To whom Serostatus disclosed	family	79	31
	Sexual partner	173	68.2
	friend	3	0.8
Stigma and discrimination	no	387	89.6
	yes	45	10.4
Do you use complementary	No	351	81.3
medicine			
	Yes	81	18.8
Do you use reminder	No	40	9.3
	Yes	392	90.7
Baseline CD4 count	≤500cells/mm³	51	13.2
	>500cells/mm ³	336	86.8
treatment regimens	tdf +3tc +efv	259	60.0
	azt + 3tc + efv	143	33.1
	azt +3tc +nvp	30	6.9
	tdf +3tc +efv	259	60.0
WHO clinical disease stage during	Stage-I	50	11.6
initiation of ART	Stage-II	352	81.5
	Stage-III	30	6.9
Recent CD4 count	≤500cells/mm ³	87	20.1
	>500cells/mm ³	341	78.9

Table 3: Adherence and health care service-related characteristics of the study participants in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021 (n = 432)

Variables		Frequencies(n=432)	Percentage (%)
Do you miss your dose in	the last 7days		
	No	352	81.5
	Yes	80	18.5
No of missed doses			
	1-2 doses	57	13.2
	3-4 doses	23	5.3
Reason for missing to tak	e ART medication		
	Away from home	19	23.75
	forgot	31	38.75
	Busy with other things	12	15
	sickness	18	22.5
Missed scheduled clinical	visit		
	No	386	89.4
	Yes	46	10.6
Do you take Drugs other	than ARV		
	No	328	75.9
	Yes	104	24.1

Table 4: Factors associated with ART adherence among adult patients on ART in public health institutions in south Gondar zone, August 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021.

Variables		Frequencies(n=432	Percentage (<mark>%)</mark>
Do you miss your dose	in the last 7days			
	No	352	81.5	
	Yes	80	18.5	
No of missed doses				
	1-2 doses	57	13.2	
	3-4 doses	23	5.3	
Reason for missing to t	ake ART medication			
	Away from home	19	23.75	
	forgot	31	38.75	
	Busy with other things	12	15	
	sickness	18	22.5	
Missed scheduled clinic	cal visit			
	No	386	89.4	
	Yes	46	10.6	
Do you take Drugs oth	er than ARV			
	No	328	75.9	
	Yes	104	24.1	
		ce among adult patients on 1, 2020, to January 31, 2021	_	
health institutions in so				
health institutions in so	Adherence to	O ARV COR(95%CI)	OR(95%CI)	p- valı
health institutions in so	Adherence to	O ARV COR(95%CI) A	OR(95%CI)	
health institutions in so		,	OR(95%CI)	_
		Non-	OR(95%CI)	
drug other than ARV		Non-	OR(95%CI)	p- valu

stigma and discrimin	nation patients on A	ART				
	no	326	61	1	1	
	yes	26	16	0.26(0.13-0.5)	0.4(0.2-0.84)	0.016
missed scheduled cli	nical visit					
	no	325	61	1	1	
	yes	27	19	0.27(0.14-0.51)	0.45(0.21-0.94)	0.034
Patients on TB treat						
	no	297	50	1	1	0.01
Recent CD4 count	yes	55	30	0.41(0.18-0.53)	0.45(0.24-0.83)	0.01
Recent CD4 count						
	≥500 cells/mm ³	328	65	1	1	0.023
	<500 cells/mm ³	27	17	0.23(0.12-0.56)	0.3(0.14-0.73)	0.007
WHO clinical stage	e three at the time	e of ART i	initiation			
Willo emilear stage						
	Stage-I	42	8	1		
	Stage-II	291	61	0.208(0.68-0.633)		
	Stage-III	12	11	0.23(0.1-0.55)	0.24(0.098-0.57)	0.027
		,	24			

STROBE Statement—checklist of items that should be included in reports of observational studies

		Item No	Recommendation	Line no	Page no
Title and abstract		1	(a) Indicate the study's design with a commonly used term in the	1-3	1
			title or the abstract		
			(b) Provide in the abstract an informative and balanced summary	23-46	2-3
			of what was done and what was found		
Introduction					
Background/ra	tionale	2	Explain the scientific background and rationale for the	66-118	4-6
			investigation being reported		
Objectives		3	State specific objectives, including any pre-specified hypotheses	119-120	6
Methods					
Study design	4	Present key ele	ments of study design early in the paper	135	7
Setting	5	Describe the se	tting, locations, and relevant dates, including periods of recruitment,	136-140	7
		exposure, follo	w-up, and data collection		
Participants	6	(a) Cohort stud	y—Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of		
		selection of par	ticipants. Describe methods of follow-up		
		Case-control s	udy—Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of		
		case ascertainn	nent and control selection. Give the rationale for the choice of cases		
		and controls			
		Cross-sectiona	<i>l study</i> —Give the eligibility criteria, and the sources and methods of	142-149	7
		selection of par	ticipants		
		(b) Cohort stud	y—For matched studies, give matching criteria and number of	N/A	
		exposed and ur	nexposed		
		Case-control s	<i>rudy</i> —For matched studies, give matching criteria and the number of		
		controls per ca	se		
Variables	7	Clearly define	all outcomes, exposures, predictors, potential confounders, and effect	158-162	8
		modifiers. Give	e diagnostic criteria, if applicable		
Data	8*	For each varia	ble of interest, give sources of data and details of methods of	164-184	8
sources/		assessment (me	easurement). Describe comparability of assessment methods if there		
measurement		is more than or	e group		
Bias	9	Describe any e	fforts to address potential sources of bias	N/A	
Study size	10	Explain how th	e study size was arrived at	189-193	9
Quantitative	11	Explain how q	nantitative variables were handled in the analyses. If applicable,	195-196	9
variables		describe which	groupings were chosen and why		
Statistical	12	(a) Describe al	statistical methods, including those used to control for confounding	199-200	9
methods		(b) Describe ar	y methods used to examine subgroups and interactions	N/A	
		(c) Explain how	v missing data were addressed	192	9
		(d) Cohort stud	y—If applicable, explain how loss to follow-up was addressed		
		Case-control s	udy—If applicable, explain how matching of cases and controls was		
		addressed			
		Cross-sectiona	<i>l study</i> —If applicable, describe analytical methods taking account of	189-203	9-10
		sampling strate	gy		
		(e) Describe ar	v sensitivity analyses		

Continued on next page

Results

13	(a) Report numbers of individuals at each stage of study—eg numbers potentially eligible,		
*	examined for eligibility, confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed	208-209	10
	(b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage	100% response rate	10
	(c) Consider use of a flow diagram	N/A	
14 *	(a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential confounders	209-221	10
-	(b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest	No missed data	10
	(c) Cohort study—Summarise follow-up time (eg, average and total amount)	N/A	
15	Cohort study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures over time	N/A	
*	Case-control study—Report numbers in each exposure category, or summary measures of exposure	N/A	
	Cross-sectional study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures	224-228	11
16	(a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included	230-239	11
-	(b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized	Table1-4	21-24
	(c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	N/A	
17	Report other analyses done—eg analyses of subgroups and interactions, and sensitivity analyses		
1 1 1	4 *	examined for eligibility, confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed (b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage (c) Consider use of a flow diagram 4 (a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential confounders (b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest (c) Cohort study—Summarise follow-up time (eg, average and total amount) 5 Cohort study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures over time * Case-control study—Report numbers in each exposure category, or summary measures of exposure * Cross-sectional study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures 6 (a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included (b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized (c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period	examined for eligibility, confirmed eligible, included in the study, completing follow-up, and analysed (b) Give reasons for non-participation at each stage (c) Consider use of a flow diagram 4 (a) Give characteristics of study participants (eg demographic, clinical, social) and information on exposures and potential confounders (b) Indicate number of participants with missing data for each variable of interest (c) Cohort study—Summarise follow-up time (eg, average and total amount) N/A Cohort study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures over time Case-control study—Report numbers in each exposure category, or summary measures of exposure Cross-sectional study—Report numbers of outcome events or summary measures (a) Give unadjusted estimates and, if applicable, confounder-adjusted estimates and their precision (eg, 95% confidence interval). Make clear which confounders were adjusted for and why they were included (b) Report category boundaries when continuous variables were categorized (c) If relevant, consider translating estimates of relative risk into absolute risk for a meaningful time period

Discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision.

Give a cautious overall interpretation of results considering objectives, limitations, multiplicity

Give the source of funding and the role of the funders for the present study and, if applicable,

N/A

245-300

301-309

311-313

314-318

339-340

12-14

N/A: Not Applicable

analyses

Discussion

Key results

Limitations

Interpretation

Generalisability

Funding

Other information

*Give information separately for cases and controls in case-control studies and, if applicable, for exposed and unexposed groups in cohort and cross-sectional studies.

Summarise key results with reference to study objectives

Discuss both direction and magnitude of any potential bias

for the original study on which the present article is based

of analyses, results from similar studies, and other relevant evidence

Discuss the generalisability (external validity) of the study results

Note: An Explanation and Elaboration article discusses each checklist item and gives methodological background and published examples of transparent reporting. The STROBE checklist is best used in conjunction with this article (freely available on the Web sites of PLoS Medicine at http://www.plosmedicine.org/, Annals of Internal Medicine at http://www.annals.org/, and Epidemiology at http://www.epidem.com/). Information on the STROBE Initiative is available at www.strobe-statement.org.